



Ministero degli Affari Esteri



Cooperazione Italiana
allo Sviluppo
Ministero Affari Esteri

DGCS | Ufficio IX
Valutazione e Visibilità

TANZANIA – NGO financing

IMPROVING THE AGRICULTURAL CONTEXT IN THE SONGEA DISTRICT

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL REHABILITATION OF MAASAI'S
PASTORAL AREAS IN THE ARUMERU DISTRICT**

**REHABILITATION OF THE ENDEMIC DISEASES MONITORING SYSTEM OF THE
NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICE IN THE ZANZIBAR ARCHIPELAGO**



2011.01

VALUTAZIONE

This evaluation report reflects only the views of its authors and does not involve in any way the DGCS. It was released in May-June 2012 by Abaton SRL that employed a team composed of Matteo SCARAMELLA, Rosario SAPIENZA, Mario POLVERINI and Elena GRILLI for quality control. The team would like to thank everyone, that contributed to the preparation and development of the mission and to its success.

Index

- 1 Executive Summary
- 2 Approach, methodology, note to the Terms of Reference
- 3 Improving the agricultural context in the Songea district -Focsiv project
-COPE AID n° 8178
 - Relevance and design quality
 - Efficiency and effectiveness
 - Impact and sustainability
 - Summary Tab
 - Lessons learned and recommendations
- 4 Economic development and environmental rehabilitation of Maasai's
pastoral areas in the Arumeru district-Oikos Project AID n° 8152
 - Relevance and design quality
 - Efficiency and effectiveness
 - Impact and sustainability
 - Summary Tab
 - Lessons learned and recommendations
- 5 Rehabilitation of the endemic diseases monitoring system of the
National Health Service in the Zanzibar archipelago- (SISME) Tanzania
Fondazione Ivo De Carneri Project AID n° 8895
 - Relevance and design quality
 - Efficiency and effectiveness
 - Impact and sustainability
 - Summary Tab
 - Lessons learned and recommendations
- 6 Conclusions, lessons learned and crosscutting issues of the three
projects

ATTACHMENTS

- 1 Acronyms list
- 2 Mission's Agenda
- 3 List of people met
- 4 List of main documents consulted

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The evaluation has given an overall positive assessment of the three projects. Their consistency with identified goals has been confirmed over the years and the positive impact on beneficiaries' living conditions is noticeable even now, a few years after the first formulation of the projects

The three NGOs showed great capability in adapting their strategy to fit the changing context, maintaining steady final objectives, even when local equilibriums became fragile.

The projects are sound with Tanzania's policies in the respective sectors: agro-pastoral, territorial protection and planning and health services.

The action in the health sector in particular, is in line with the former Italian Cooperation commitment, which carries on an integrated initiatives program in the Country, directly or through other entities.

Project evaluation summary tabs

The analytic evaluation, lead following the *Project Cycle Management* (PCM) methodology and the *Logical Framework Approach* (LFA), enabled the understanding of the specific character of each project on the basis of the basic parameters of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability.

In order to avoid the reiteration of some of the critical inconvenience occurred, the evaluation team has been very attentive to the planning phase (design quality) which has shown some weaknesses in current projects, i.e. - over ambitious objectives, undervaluation of times and resources needed for the implementation of the activities, problems with the identification of indicators.

The following summary tabs reports the main project objectives at different levels, a synthesis of the evaluation assessment and the rating given for each OCSE-DAC criteria.

IMPROVING THE AGRICULTURAL CONTEXT IN THE SONGEA DISTRICT

Focsiv-COPE Project AID n° 8178

Planning	Relevance Rating: "A" very good	
<p>The project matches the need to improve the rural living conditions by increasing the domestic economy and enhancing opportunities of the Songea District villages, in south Tanzania. The project plan is entirely consistent with the needs of the area and with the rural, agricultural and pastoral vocation primacy. Appropriate concern for development and infrastructural policies as traditionally defined in Tanzania, is conveyed in their general vocation, as agriculture represents the main economic activity of the country, and specifically in the Songea district that is one of the major producers in the region. The training offer responds to the double need of general orientation and of practical and focused skills, paying attention to the technical aspects as well as to the economic side of the rural productive activities. Furthermore, the project offers its beneficiaries the access credit for the start-up and consolidation of small productive or commercial activities.</p>		
	Design quality Rating: "C" problems	
<p>The project plan shows significant limits in four crucial aspects: a) the overall timeline to deliver output is manifestly inadequate if compared to the expected results, b) The identification of target and final beneficiaries is not sufficiently clear and precise, c) The objectively verifiable indicators (IOV) are often merely criteria without qualitative and quantitative indication on levels to achieve and on baseline data d) The project lacks a convincing exit strategy or an explicitly defined risk management strategy.</p>		
Specific Objective	Impact Rating: "B" satisfactory Sustainability Rating: "C" problems	Overall Objectives
<p>Multiplying the employment opportunities of about 300 young people and local farmers favouring their work access and improving their entrepreneurial abilities in Songea District.</p>	<p>During these years the project has been able to generate a virtuous circle and a gain in the region. Through its training activity linked to credit access, the CRAS centre (Consorzio Rurale Agro-ecologico of Songea) has turned its students into small entrepreneurs in a few years. Unfortunately, there is a lack of a monitoring system allowing the measurement of the micro entrepreneurial activities success involved in the project. The initiative opens spaces for sustainable development and not harmful to the endogenous and traditional equilibriums. The good reputation of the CRAS centre and of its activities is palpable in the local and national context. There still remains significant untapped potential of the centre. A strong critical element is represented by the financial sustainability; the centre is currently able to cover only 30% of its costs. Another critical element is the exit strategy, as it is still uncertain whether the centre will be taken in charge from the Archdiocese or if it will be included among the training centres accredited by the Ministry of Education.</p>	<p>Rural poverty factors reduction in Songea District</p>

Results	Effectiveness Rating: "B" satisfactory	Specific Objective
1) CRAS centre building, organization and equipment; 2) agro-zootechnical production and officinal; 3) vocational training; 4) technical and financial (microcredit); 5) consciousness on human promotion and sustainable development.	The variety of good practices and examples confirm how much the integrated and complementary approach between orientation, economic and technical skills, together with microcredit access can be fruitful. The associated and cooperative work, however, has had some difficulties at the implementation level not providing the expected results. The information campaign addressed to recruit new students is inadequate as it is carried out exclusively by the Archdiocese. The CRAS centre is very well equipped and can offer further optimization and extension possibilities. Most of its activities (training, production or services provision) can be further enhanced and made more efficient. Moreover, there is room to add additional activities to the services already in place, capitalizing the existing means and resources.	Rural poverty factors reduction in multiplying the employment opportunities of about 300 young people and local farmers favouring their work access and improving their entrepreneurial abilities in Songea District.
Activities	Efficiency Rating: "B" satisfactory	Results
1) training centre building and equipment, waterworks and management system 2) agricultural and zootechnical production 3) training courses, anthropologic studies, seminars 4) technical assistance, microcredit, microenterprise services 5) promotion activity in villages and schools	The project has been realized responsively by COPE staff, which succeeded in ensuring the scheduled activities implementation and problem solving as well as unexpected events. Beyond some delays, the CRAS today is a first class training centre and regarded as a centre of excellence for its architectural, management and logistic quality. The centre is well managed with a very motivated staff. With the exception of microcredit data, it has not been possible to have access to aggregated and updated data, not only on frequencies but also on the rating and follow up of the young micro entrepreneurs that could synthetically give a measure of the effective CRAS performance from the beginning.	1) CRAS centre building, organization and equipment; 2) agro-zootechnical production and officinal; 3) vocational training; 4) technical and financial (microcredit); 5) awareness on human promotion and sustainable development.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL REHABILITATION OF MAASAI'S PASTORAL AREAS IN THE ARUMERU DISTRICT

Oikos Project AID n° 8152

Design	Relevance Rating: "A" very good	
<p>The project deals with relevant issues of the Arumeu District. Its relevance, compared to the needs encountered, is very much perceptible, regarding simultaneously the approach and the content. The chosen activities deal with the phenomenon of progressive anthropic settlement of the area and the delicate evolution of socio-economic and cultural structures of local communities, in order to support their sustainable development. The project is in line with other policies promoted by the Government of Tanzania in the area concerning spatial planning and natural resources conservation. The project deals with different aspects linked to the development and rehabilitation of the territory following an integrated approach to foster the necessary synergies between different interventions, taking care at the same time of the involvement of various stakeholders, not only at the operational level, but also in the governance.</p>		
Quality of design Rating: "C" problems		
<p>The intervention logic results partly dispersed, starting with the five specific objectives, each of which corresponds to a battery of results (20 in total) and 26 activities, not always directly linked to the results.</p> <p>The level of accuracy of the objectively verifiable indicators (IOVs) is modest. Especially in the first two specific objectives, the emphasis falls on the transfer of technical and scientific skills to local authorities and on issues related to the production of data, leaving behind aspects of mediation and conflict resolution, which are central elements of participatory territorial management. The limited consideration of these aspects in the design phase is a critical issue in terms of efficiency and effectiveness of activities and results.</p>		
Specific Objectives	Impact Rating: "B" satisfactory Sustainability Rating: "B" problems	Overall objective
<p>1) Strengthen the capacity of Meru District to plan and manage natural resources.</p> <p>2) Support the Maasai community of the District of Meru in preparation of Territorial Village Plans.</p> <p>3) Improving the skills and operational capacity of the Maasai community to protect and manage their livestock and environmental resources.</p> <p>4) Enhance the quality, values and abilities of economic and sustainable use of environmental resources.</p> <p>5) Increase the sensitivity and awareness of the international community on the issues of sustainable economic growth.</p>	<p>The project has made an important contribution to the on-going decentralization process of the territorial management in Tanzania. Various counterchecks demonstrate a positive impact on the maintenance and increase of wildlife, high vegetation and an improvement of the living conditions of the local population. From the project's conclusion to date, the Meru District has approved two other <i>Land Use Plan</i> (LUP), confirming the on-going need for planning by the entities and officials in charge, not yet completely understood by local administrations. The benefits produced by the project are palpable, present and active even after two years, with help of Oikos that in a moderate and indirect way sustain a certain number of small organizations, like the Maasai women's craft activities, Mkuru Camel Safari tourist services, the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) and the Village Game Scout (VGS) activities. Oikos represents, mostly through its Mkuru Training Centre (MTU), an essential protection and a reference point for the whole area, and especially for the Maasai community. The unlikely draw back of Oikos from the area, without a clear and shared exit strategy, would determine in any case a drastic stall in the process launched by the project and an evident reduction of the output.</p>	<p>Supporting the Maasai communities, in close cooperation with the Ameru District authorities, to improve their living condition trough the identification and experimentation of new strategies and territorial management models, founded on local traditions and culture, responding to the on-going evolutions of the economic and social context and created on the basis of the opportunities offered by the most recent national and International policies concerning the sustainable and participatory management of the natural and zoo-technical resources.</p>

Results	Effectiveness Rating: "B" satisfactory	Specific Objectives
<p>1) Launch of the office, technical skills development, basic information collection, databases, decision-making support system.</p> <p>2) agreements, information, territorial planning, collaborations.</p> <p>3) improvement of the health of the livestock, the Maasai knowledge in relation to their environmental heritage and to the proper management of natural resources.</p> <p>4) availability of pools of water, veterinary care, anti-poaching units, environmental rehabilitation, responsible tourism.</p> <p>5) technical brochure and publicity material, events.</p>	<p>The results achieved are generally very positive and constitute for the beneficiary and local authorities an important example of growth and improvement of the economic situation and local living conditions, as well as an increase of the widespread possibility of influencing the safeguarding of the delicate habitat.</p> <p>The implementation of the Uwiro LUP represents a significant model for participatory planning in the region. In contrast, a significant portion of the final beneficiaries does not have access to the benefits derived from the project results. The Mkuru Camel Safari currently has the direct participation of 25 members, mostly young people from different ethnic groups and the Maasai Women Art has 138 Maasai women and their number is constantly growing, as well as their sales, thanks to connections created with the private sector and with a network of e-commerce. Both the component of the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) and that of Village Game Scouts (VGS) continue to be active, although they express certain fragility, due to the fact that both of these components were not sufficiently articulated in a perspective of real sustainability.</p>	<p>1) Strengthen the capacity of Meru District to plan and manage natural resources.</p> <p>2) Support the Maasai community of the District of Meru in preparation of Territorial Village Plans.</p> <p>3) Improving the skills and operational capacity of the Maasai community to protect and manage their livestock and environmental resources.</p> <p>4) Enhance the quality, values and abilities of economic and sustainable use of environmental resources.</p> <p>5) Increase the understanding and awareness of the international community on the issues of sustainable economic growth.</p>
Activities	Efficiency Rating: "B" satisfactory	Results
<p>A) Start-up activities of the project (1, 2 and 3).</p> <p>B) planning office, 2 GIS unity(4), vocational training(5), collection of information(6), GIS archive (7), decision-making support system(8).</p> <p>C) dialogue (9), collection of information (10), GIS data organization (11) territorial plans (12) meetings and workshop (13).</p> <p>D) vocational training for community members on the zoo-technical heritage (14) and on preservation and management techniques of the natural resources (15) meeting to raise the communitarian sensitization (16).</p> <p>E) hydraulic micro-intervention(17), veterinary structure(18) anti-poaching unit(19) environmental rehabilitation(20) cultural tourism (21).</p> <p>F) technical brochure and publicity material (22), monograph on Maasai(23), projects closing activities (24-26).</p>	<p>The project has been carried out in an efficient manner respecting the scheduled timing and expenditure, in compliance with description of the project.</p> <p>The high quality of inputs spread by the project is remarkable, both in terms of qualified human resources and in the quality and accuracy of supplies and materials selected and implemented.</p> <p>The good balance of distribution of input between the different categories of beneficiaries, the excellent relationship between project staff and local counterparts, and proper care in proposing and accompanying the planned shift processes without pandering destabilizing tendencies, are all positive factors that emerged during the mission.</p> <p>The reporting and internal monitoring systems of the project are adequate, with good outreach capacity compared to the project results. The greatest problems faced by project activities concerned the technical process for the definition of the LUP, because of the conflict between different interests expressed by local stakeholders including those of the institutions managing nature reserves. They have been able to complete the process for only the LUP of the village of Uwiro, compared to the five originally planned. All other outputs are realized and visible.</p>	<p>1) Launch of the office, technical skills development, basic information collection, databases, decision-making support system.</p> <p>2) agreements, information, territorial planning, collaborations.</p> <p>3) improvement of the health of the livestock, the Maasai knowledge in relation to their environmental heritage and to the proper management of natural resources.</p> <p>4) availability of pools of water, veterinary care, anti-poaching units, environmental rehabilitation, responsible tourism.</p> <p>5) technical brochure and publicity material , events.</p>

REHABILITATION OF THE ENDEMIC DISEASES MONITORING SYSTEM OF THE NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICE IN THE ZANZIBAR ARCHIPELAGO - Tanzania (SISME)

Foundation Ivo De Carneri Project AID n° 8895

Planning	Relevance Rating: "B" satisfactory	
<p>The project is relevant with the commitment of the Italian Cooperation in Tanzania and Zanzibar where the DGCD has launched during the same period other initiatives in the health sector and only partially consistent with the Zanzibar health policies. The potential positive effects of the efficient use of data and information systems are remarkable, both on the prevention front and in that of a more efficient planning and management of services and investments. This urgency, as long as it is consistent and self-evident, is only indirectly addressed to the immediate satisfaction of final beneficiaries' basic needs, the Zanzibar families. A more direct and explicit use of the Public Health Laboratory (PHL) in the territorial health services prompt support would have strengthened the intervention relevance also regarding the local needs as they are perceived by the population.</p>		
	Design Quality Rating: "B" satisfactory	
<p>The expected results represents three consistent steps towards the achievement of the project's specific objective, together with the punctual identification of direct beneficiaries, about 500 health operators, active in the dispensaries, districts and hospitals. The project's logic is fully understandable with reference to the process the Ivo de Carneri Foundation launched in 1997. Initially launched on a three-year basis but then limited to one year without reducing its ambitions, the project results to be undersized compared to the timing, which has been extended for seven additional months followed by the definition of a further three-year phase.</p>		
Specific Objective	Impact Rating: "B" satisfactory Sustainability Rating: "C" problems	Overall objective
<p>Strengthening of the PHL central role and of the Health Districts structures through the adequate provision of means and equipment for the health data collection and human resources training in the epidemic surveillance area.</p>	<p>The project contributed to institutional empowerment, providing its support to the "Health Management Information System" qualification and its status within the Health Ministry in Zanzibar. The project focused mainly on the staff and services at intermediate level, i.e. reaching the District, hospital areas and HMIS central office operators and some of the health facilities. There is still plenty of work to do, as planned by the on-going three-year project (SISME II Phase). The services and benefits produced by the project are at risk of drastic reductions if international community support slows down; this high external dependence is very common in the context in which the MoHSW and the Zanzibar government operates in general. On the contrary, the project has brought significant results on the PHL institutional sustainability, including the HMIS Operative Unit at its premises, with the consequent centralization of a series of networking functions that had finally made the PHL an important articulation of Zanzibar health public system. This institutional sustainability could be strengthened if the PHL would dedicate larger spaces to services with immediate effect on the territory and population.</p>	<p>Enhancement of the population's health conditions in Zanzibar by the rehabilitation of the epidemic and endemic diseases surveillance system, as an indispensable tool for the health interventions' improvement</p>

Results	Effectiveness Rating: "B" satisfactory	Specific Objective
1) strengthening	The main result achieved by the project consisted in	Strengthening of the PHL-IdC

<p>of Pemba's Ministerial Office through the HMIS (Health Management Information System) Operative Unit collocation in the Public Health Laboratory Ivo De Carneri (PHL-IdC);</p> <p>2) the human resources training in epidemic surveillance;</p> <p>3) The Health District structures strengthening by the provision of equipment and means for health data collection and analysis</p>	<p>the strengthening of the Ministerial Office in Pemba through the Health Management Information System Operative Unit placement in the Public Health Laboratory Ivo De Carneri (PHL-IdC). The PHL represents a forefront and well-equipped structure able to carry on activities at a higher level than those it usually manages. To date, although the high number of staff members and adequate laboratory structures are at its disposal, the PHGL results are still underused if compared to its role of national laboratory. The PHL keeps operating mainly on project and funds other than those provided by the MoHSW for the ordinary management of the centre that are insufficient for ensuring the full functioning of the structure. The data produced by the HMIS is regularly used by the MoHSW for the publication of periodical reports and it is also thanks to the project that the HMIS vaunt an excellent reputation within the Ministry and donors involved in the health sector. The PHL and Carneri Foundation institutional counterpart, the HMIS department, proved to be, despite some initial resistance, an efficient and motivated ally that has successfully embraced the challenge proposed by the project.</p>	<p>central role and of the Health Districts structures by the equipment and means for the collection and analysis of health data supply and human resources training in the epidemic surveillance domain.</p>
Activities	Efficiency Rating: "B" satisfactory	Results
<p>1) space identification, equipment purchase and installation, data transfer and local staff training.</p> <p>2) courses organization, didactic material production.</p> <p>3) district and central headquarters equipment, means and vehicles.</p>	<p>Most of the project activities have been realized in scheduled time. The supply of equipment to PHL and to the Health Districts was carried out without particular problems or obstacles and PHL staff proved to be motivated and efficient in the project activities realization. The wages public policy that tends to motivate the participation through forms of economic incentive required particular care in the human resources management as well as in the beneficiaries' participation. The PHL employs, about 50 permanent staff members of which about 90% is paid by the MoHSW and up to 300 people paid from the funds of the project, on a "needs" basis. The training has noticed a level of attendance higher than expected, involving about 526 different typologies of health operators. From the qualitative results perspective, the training outputs have been lower than desired due to the starting-level of skills of the operators, generally poor because of a limited presence of epidemiology statistic characteristics in the conventional CVs of the country. In order to enhance the training efficiency the Ivo de Carneri Foundation realized further training courses compared to those initially planned.</p>	<p>1) strengthening of Pemba's Ministerial Office through the HMIS (Health Management Information System) Operative Unit collocation in the Public Health Laboratory Ivo De Carneri (PHL-IdC);</p> <p>2) the human resources training in epidemic surveillance;</p> <p>3) The Health District structures strengthening by the provision of equipment and means for health data collection and analysis.</p>

Main conclusions of the intervention

Most of the problems encountered are due to the excessive time elapsed between the formulation and the start of the activities. When a project starts years after the preparation of the programming documents, which form the contractual basis of the project, it may find different and unexpected conditions on the field; then the entire project needs to be reprogrammed, sometimes even identifying new partners and local stakeholders, particularly costly in terms of resources and time consuming. This is a crucial aspect on which, starting from this assessment, it is appropriate to constructively consider. Today the procedures for the instruction and approval of projects are unbearably long and complex, insufficiently standardized and inefficient, even if they purport to define thoroughly the levels of analytical detail both of the technical aspects and the administrative ones.

To give just an example for each for the case studied, the source of water originally existing has been impoverished as a result of deforestation activities (Focsiv COPE), the administrative organization of the Tanzanian State has changed and also the institutional dialogue (Oikos), the system of incentives for the staff of the Ministry is evolving in a different way than originally expected (De Carneri).

Pending a rationalization and acceleration of the approval process, a reprogramming of the projects should be required of NGOs within 30-90 days from the approval, taking into account the changes occurred in the context during the approval period. The reprogramming should follow the main parameters of the project: total budget and its allocation, duration, main objectives (see Recommendation 1), but it may present variations in activities plans allowing them to adapt to any possible change occurred.

The three projects are the result of the processes that NGOs have started years before the implementation of the interventions co-financed by the DGCD representing the culmination or a significant moment of a path that rarely runs out within the time limits of the project financed.

The stable presence and continuous activity of an NGO in the field are of fundamental significance for the sustainability, since at the end of a project the NGO itself will seek other funding and supporting actions, with highly variable results. The three NGOs have deployed every effort to combine the operational model typical of funded projects - which require a high spending power in a limited time and the achievement of specifically defined objectives - with the model of intervention of NGOs, that count on a long presence in a country and in a sector and which act at slower pace, in progressive modality, partially flexible and programmable.

Spread-out interventions in support of benefits generated by the investment of NGOs and DGCD could maximize the positive effects achieved by the projects more efficiently. (see Recommendation 2).

Unfortunately, all three projects prove to be in difficulty, particularly from the perspective of economic sustainability of the services and facilities created through the projects. The laboratory of analysis and research of the Foundation De Carneri is destined to be drastically underutilized if not able to attract new funding. The

training centre of agricultural livestock Focsiv / COPE has serious problems of sustainability and is not able to cover more than a third of its operating costs. The Mkuru Training Centre (MTU), around which gravitate most services, knowledge and skills developed by Oikos' project, will not remain stable without the guarantee of a constant presence and investment of Oikos East Africa.

This evaluation discloses another interesting aspect related to the previous one: the activities of NGOs in Tanzania show a high degree of efficiency, in fact they yield to the Italian system much more than they cost. Thanks to their mission and their roots, which are beyond the limited timing of projects, NGOs constantly feed the processes that have maximized through projects with their direct involvement. They incessantly promote fundraising activities, which often detect different funds that may come from the European Commission (COPE), the decentralized cooperation (Oikos) or other international agencies (Oikos) and the network of supporters that all NGOs have. Even in the absence of a loan granted directly by the DGCS, projects and NGOs are Italian in terms of skills and mobilization of human resources and contribute to foster that culture and the need for solidarity, dialogue and exchange that are at the basis of the aim declared by the Italian Cooperation to "ensure respect for human dignity and ensure economic growth of all nations."

Finally, the added value of the Italian system is not limited to the contribution brought by each NGO but the main factor is the potential transferability of skills, resources and relationships that each NGO can make available to the other. From this point of view, the role of the Embassy in Dar es Salaam and the antenna of coordination have played in the past is a key role in ensuring the coordination and exchange functions which require continuity of action and - if possible - further enhancement (see Recommendation 3).

In light of the overall findings of the mission, the following recommendations are addressed to the DGCS and local offices of the Italian Cooperation:

Recommendation 1 - Improve the efficiency, timeliness and effectiveness of the inquiry process for the approval of projects endorsed. In order to reduce the time of investigation, it would be desirable to approve projects on the basis of a more synthetic and standardized series of parameters to allow the definition and approval of a detailed operational plan during the mobilization phase. A procedure to update the projects as they are approved is also required.

Recommendation 2 - Develop a program of micro interventions that, with limited investment and punctual actions, supports processes already initiated during a period of phasing out, maximising and making sustainable the positive effects of the projects.

Recommendation 3 - Ensure a function of coordination and exchange of information and directives, directly from Rome or through the antenna of the UTL in Dar es Salaam. It is of vital importance to facilitate the exchange of experiences and resolutions of cross-cutting issues, as well as going into topics treated by some NGOs to benefit the others, or using the territorial protection guaranteed in various regions of Tanzania from different organizations. If it could hardly be envisaged, in times of dramatic cuts in public spending, the quantitative strengthening of the central and peripheral technical structures, is certainly desirable and a possible

increase of their efficiency and their effectiveness primarily through the streamlining of procedures, clear assignment of responsibilities, establishment of simple regular and timely reporting systems.

The following recommendations are addressed to NGOs:

Recommendation 4 - Pay greater attention to the definition of IOV project indicators, the collection of baseline data and internal monitoring system that shall use the Logical Framework (LF) as a reference tool. It is worth remembering that this tool is not limited to the Logical Framework Matrix, but is composed of seven steps, all necessary and consistent with each other; one of the fundamental aspects of the preparation of a project using the Logical Framework Approach (LFA) is its participatory process. A LF conceived by the main actors together gives enormously greater guarantees of success than those that can be offered by a LF built by a project-manager alone. If it is not possible to do this during the formulation phase, it should be done at least in the reprogramming process, when the actors are reunited in the same place and have full knowledge of the operating context.

Recommendation 5 - Evaluation of the potentialities of the infrastructure created. The objectives, expected results and expectations desired for the centres and physical structures created by NGOs functionally to the projects, should be carefully assessed: in all the three cases (CRAS, the MTU, the LUP) their potential expressed within the projects do not appear properly exploited and the management prospects are not fully realized.

Recommendation 6 - The analysis of risk encountered during the implementation of the projects, the development of a strategy for managing risk, an exit strategy and of a convincing sustainability plan for their activities and benefits, should be included in programming on a regular basis.

APPROACH, METHODOLOGY, NOTE TO THE TERMS OF REFERENCE

The approach used in the evaluation is that of the Logical Framework (LF), based on the reconstruction of program logic for all stages of the life cycle of the project.

The evaluation has the specific function to measure the degree of achievement of the specific objectives of the project, the first impact results and whether the conditions for sustainability subsist. It was carried out in a mixed form, combining external observation together with the involvement of the project actors (counterparties, project managers, beneficiaries).

The assessment set the following objectives:

- to express a judgement on the relevance of the objectives and their level of achievement;
- to appreciate efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of projects;
- to review projects in their whole, to identify good practices and lessons learned in order to use them as a knowledge base to improve future planning;
- to analyse the strategies and methods of implementation;
- to identify and analyse sustainability factors and the impact that the implementation of these projects will have on the socio-economic conditions of the country.

The criteria used in the evaluation are those defined by the OECD-DAC for the assessment of this type of intervention: relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. In the analysis of relevance, it was considered appropriate to pay particular attention to the design and definition of the intervention logic in all its aspects: identification of objectively verifiable performance indicators, analysis of the context and external factors, risk analysis and its management strategy, exit strategy.

For each parameter considered, a brief evaluation of performance was given ("Rating"), with a scale ranging from "A" to "D", with "A" for "Very Good", "B" for "Satisfactory", "C" for "Problems" and "D" for "Serious Difficulties".

The evaluation was carried out combining the analysis of various sources of information, internal or external to projects, analysis of data and reports of previous monitoring, inspections and site visits, interviews with government counterparts, project partners, direct beneficiaries or the population of those areas, managers and project staff and partner agencies, and with other local and international actors that could give an external and impartial opinion of the project.

The mission began contacting the offices of DGCD responsible for the tutoring of the projects, by collecting information and the required documentation for the analysis and by making contact with NGOs headquarters in Italy.

The evaluation was composed of three distinct phases:

- a desk analysis of documents (end of April beginning of May);
- a field mission (May);
- a reporting phase (June, early July).

Definition of the evaluation questions

The desk analysis and the first interviews with the project actors led to the definition of the evaluation questions, outlined below.

For the relevance and quality of design:

- How much the projects capture in their intervention strategy the actual needs of their beneficiaries?
- How much the projects capture and are consistent with medium-term politic strategies of the intervention's Countries?
- Is the intervention logic detailed and consistent? Is the composition of the partnership appropriate to the objectives? Are the performance indicators well defined? Are there a risk management strategy and an exit strategy?

For efficiency:

- How much were the projects able to start real and solid practices of collaboration with local counterparts?
- How much the projects managed to comply with their contractual obligations in terms of expenditure and implementation of activities on schedule? Is the output proportionate to the resources used? Did they effectively lead to the achievement of the expected results?
- Is there a system of management control and results-oriented monitoring of the activities?

For effectiveness:

- To what extent the output of project activities effectively led to the achievement of the specific objective (or specific objectives)?
- To what extent were the projects able to respond to unexpected changes and adapt their intervention strategy while maintaining their internal consistency?

For impact:

- To what extent the achievement of the specific objective has contributed to the achievement of the overall objective?
- Which effects, expected or unexpected, positive or negative, the projects have generally determined in the context in which they operated?

For sustainability:

- How much were the projects able to achieve lasting and sustainable benefits beyond the duration of the interventions?
- Which mechanisms have been put in place to ensure that projects represent a solid foundation for further development processes?

EVALUATION OF PROJECTS

IMPROVING THE AGRICULTURAL CONTEXT OF SONGEA DISTRICT CIDSE-COPE AID PROJECT N ° 8178

PROJECT DATA

Title	Improving the Agricultural Context of Songea district
AID n°	8178
NGO	Focsiv, in consortium with COPE
Total budget (€)	1.693.183,33
DGCS contribution (€)	846.495,63
Place	Songea District-Ruvuma Region
Partners	Songea's Archdiocese
Sector	DAC code 31120 - "Agricultural development"
Starting date	11/07/2007
End date	10/07/2010 (scheduled) 10/03/2011 (real)
Duration (scheduled and real)	36 (scheduled) 44 (real)
Brief description of the project	In order to reduce the local factors of rural poverty in the District of Songea the project aims to increase the number of employment opportunities of at least 300 young people and encourage local farmers access to employment and improving their business skills. The engine of this multiplier is the Rural Agro-ecological Consortium of Songea(CRAS) physical centre and logistics infrastructure that ensures its contribution through the construction, organization and equipment (outcome 1), the agro-zoo technical production and officinal (result 2), vocational training (outcome 3) and the technical and financial assistance to micro-entrepreneurs (result 4). Another result concerns the promotion of human development and sustainable development (outcome 5) done in cooperation with local schools.

Relevance and quality of design

Rating Relevance: "A"¹

The project understands the strong need to improve the living conditions in rural areas increasing the opportunities for growth of the domestic economy in villages of the Songea district (*wilaya*) in Southern Tanzania.

The project plan is totally consistent with the needs identified in the area and at the same time with the primacy of the rural, agricultural and pastoral vocation as it is traditionally defined by the development policies of the Tanzania's Government, both in its general vocation, since agriculture is the main economic activity in Tanzania, and in particular, taking into account that the Songea's district is among the major producers of the region.

The COPE's settlement in Songea dates back to 1998, while it is present in Tanzania since 1989. The progressive identification of potential infrastructure and services, the creation of the CRAS centre and its rapid implementation, as well as its maintenance following a financial sustainability and functional perspective, are part of a process originated in previous years and that find in the project a consolidation momentum and an advance.

The project has been able to combine the operative model typical of funded projects, which require a high spending capacity in a limited time and the achievement of specifically defined objectives, with the model of intervention of NGOs that have a long presence in a country and a sector, which act at slower pace, in progressive modality, only partially flexible and programmable.

Rating Quality Design "C"

The initial setting design of the intervention shows contradictory elements. The integrated approach followed by project represents a crucial component, able to respond to the needs of the final beneficiaries.

The training offer serves two relevant needs: on the one hand, the need for general orientation to the possible activities in the rural context, ranging from knowledge related to various crops (agriculture) breeding of various animals (animal husbandry); on the other hand, the offer of a compact range of courses focused on the acquisition of practical and immediate skills and on the effective establishment or consolidation of production activities, including management .

The training offer cares and carries on with equal emphasis both the technical aspects and the economic productive activities in rural areas, taking into consideration the need to create through this project a network of agricultural micro-entrepreneurs, rather than pure technicians.

¹ The Rating ranges from "A" to "D", with "A" being "Very Good", "B" being "Satisfactory", "C" being "Problems" and "D" being "Very problematic".

The project offers the beneficiaries comprehensive basic training, access to financial resources for the start-up and consolidation of small manufacturing, or commercial enterprises. From this point of view the approach is particularly suitable both to the needs of the beneficiaries requiring diversified knowledge and skills, and to material resources to put them into practice.

The project design, even if solid, is affected by some crucial aspects whose effects can also be found at some stage of the implementation phase:

- The overall timing of the intervention is clearly inadequate to meet the objective of the project: the construction and set up of a large training and agricultural production centre as the one created by the project requires much more than 36 months;
- The targeted beneficiaries are not well defined as the intervention is addressed both to disadvantaged rural populations and to young people, in order to encourage them to start their own businesses and not to leave the country;
- The objectively verifiable indicators (OVI) often end up being only parameters, lacking the initial data and the quantification of objectives, not allowing adequate measurement of the project performance;
- The analysis of risk and sustainability is not present; furthermore a realistic exit strategy that draws a clear and convincing path through which the CRAS pass from the expatriate COPE's staff to a local management system, whether it will be under the responsibility of the Archdiocese or of the local or central Government is not completely planned .

Efficiency and effectiveness

Rating Efficiency: "B"

The on site visit of the project 14 months after its conclusion, allowed the appreciation of the existence and the efficient maintenance of the infrastructures and of the project's activities. The COPE's staff in place continues to ensure careful supervision that contributes to guaranteeing that the centre continues its activities at the same pace achieved in the mature execution phase of the project.

COPE is now in charge of all the centre's management costs because the activities generated by the project cannot as yet cover the relevant expenses; a few months ago the centre's management was supported through another project from which COPE benefited in consortium with CEFA (European Committee for Training and Agriculture) from Bologna. The project Saafi: Sustainable Agriculture Food Insecurity in the districts of Against Kilolo and Namtumbo.

Regarding the expected results according to the original description of the project, the association UVIKASO has not been confirmed as program partner. The association founded by a group of young people from the Archdioceses, was not adequately consolidated and, when it came to follow up the implementation of the project, it seemed more realistic to proceed through the direct and formal involvement of the Archdioceses.

As shown from reports, testimonies and direct feedback, the project has been carried out conscientiously by the COPE's staff who were able to comply with their project

responsibilities by ensuring the execution of scheduled activities and the solution of problems and unexpected events that occurred.

A remarkable difference between planned and tangible activities carried out consists in the solution originally envisaged for the CRAS centre concerning the water supply, a component of the project not feasible within the time originally planned: the supply was not suitable and adequate. They overcame the problem by capturing a stream that flows into the 86 hectares of land available for the CRAS and attributable to the Archdiocese. This issue has naturally led at the beginning of the project to a laborious technical-financial redefinition, solving the problem without any change in cost. To date, even with further unexpected events (a fire that damaged a branch of supply and the poor execution of works on a small dam beside a catchment area) the availability of water is about 50% of what originally intended.

Beyond the physiological delays the project faced in the course of its development that are all motivated and described in the report, the 750 square meter CRAS centre is a harmonious structure, both for the architectural arrangement and for the routine maintenance. The arrangement of the four blocks around the central square with its well-kept flowerbeds gives the centre prestige that makes it attractive to students who come here to spend two months taking part in intensive courses. The centre has two large rooms, 70 beds, a staff room, a computer room (complete with 5 stations and equipped by EC funds), TV room, administrative offices, offices for the management of microcredit, canteen, warehouses, kitchen and pantry as well as other areas and facilities for farming and breeding.

The centre is in general well managed and the staff is well aware of its responsibilities and duties. The teaching staff, comparatively young and very motivated, is generally appreciated by the students, also for their teaching style that tends to be direct, practical and informal compared to Tanzania's traditional training models.

The favourite approach is in fact peer-to-peer, encouraging teaching by former students or other people from backgrounds and socio-economic and cultural conditions, similar to those of the students. The teachers, rather than officials, experts or professors, are "local development agents" (as they are defined in the project), and are encouraged to pursue, parallel to the teaching, practical activities and projects within the centre.

This efficiency noticed within the spaces dedicated to education and care services for students, is also present in other areas related to the centre: agricultural production (at the time of the visit composed by rice, corn, fruit trees, vegetables) and different types of livestock (chickens, pigs, rabbits, goats, cows and, to a lesser extent, fish farming and beekeeping). To date, 50 people are employed at the centre: 7 lecturers, 10 managers and administrative management staff, and the rest are employed in agricultural activities.

The centre is formally managed by a Steering Committee comprising key people in the centre's management, representatives of the Archdiocese, members of the provincial office of agriculture of Mamtumbo (the Ward) and of the regional agriculture office in Songea and the mayor of Msindo village. Among this Board, whose activities have been mostly sporadic, there is the Council of teachers of the centre, which meets weekly to address ordinary management issues. The participation during the mission at a meeting of this more operational body, allowed the evaluator to appreciate the high motivation

and interest of the majority of teachers to take an active role and contribute to the future of the centre. In fact, the ultimate responsibility both financial and managerial, falls on COPE's expatriate personnel and finances.

According to the reports, in three years the project realized 16 courses and graduated 376 people, of which over 30% are women, surpassing the expected target.

Table 1 - course realized during the three-year of CRAS centre

course	students	Of which women	% women	graduated	% graduated
1	21	2	9,5	17	81,0
2	17	3	17,6	17	100,0
3	29	13	44,8	29	100,0
4	14	7	50,0	14	100,0
5	23	6	26,1	19	82,6
6	21	1	4,8	16	76,2
7	23	11	47,8	23	100,0
8	26	12	46,2	22	84,6
9	28	6	21,4	21	75,0
10	18	7	38,9	18	100,0
11 e 12	52	17	32,7	41	78,8
13	63	13	20,6	50	79,4
14	33	9	27,3	26	78,8
15	30	5	16,7	26	86,7
16	30	18	60,0	28	93,3
Total	428	130	30,4	367	85,7

Despite the potential existence of all the relevant data, it was not possible to have access to updated aggregated data in order to summarise the actual performance of CRAS from its beginnings to date, during the mission. Data of the students' attendance of the courses, their performance and their satisfaction is available and regularly collected but there is a lack of reports providing a comprehensive framework on which to make appropriate reflections.

However, an exception is constituted by the micro-credit component that stores data in aggregated files from which you can draw the conclusion that on 350 micro-credit contracts achieved, in total 170 beneficiaries had access to a first credit availability amounting to 100,000 Tanzanian shillings and, if they repaid the debt, they would have access to two other loan disbursements amounting to 250,000 and 600,000 shillings respectively. Since September 2009, the date on which the scheme started, there has been a total supply of about 24,000 euro and the signing of about 280 contracts. The interest rate was 10.23% for the first loan of 100,000 shillings, 10.93% for the second and 22.7% for the third.

Table 2 - micro-credit

	Micro-credit step			Total
	100.000 TZs	250.000 TZs	600.000 TZs	
Contracts	172	94	13	279
TZs	17.160.000	22.750.000	7.800.000	47.710.000
Euro*	8.580	11.375	3.900	23.855

*With an Exchange rate of 1 euro = 2000 shillings

The recovery rate is about 60%, which is low. The staff running micro-credit is very undersized (to date only one person is working there) and incentive mechanisms for recovery are weak.

Effectiveness Rating : “B”

A high "sense of ownership" of the activities and services provided by the project, both on the training front and on credit access, is present among students who attended the centre at the time of the visit and was also detected in the former students interviewed during visits of the grounds.

The visits and surveys made it possible to appreciate the existence of many good practices and success stories that confirm how much the integrated and complementary approach between orientation, technical and economic skills and access to microcredit can bear excellent results.

A highly emphasized aspect in the original project documents, that in fact had a poor implementation, is the promotion of associated and cooperative work that has proved difficult to put into practice. Even where the groups were encouraged by the modalities of microcredit delivery, which required the establishment of fair warranty groups among loan beneficiaries, feedback and surveys show how the tendency to working in groups, both as definitive arrangement and as temporary partnership, is an exception rather than the rule. The prevailing model of work is that of a small or a micro-entrepreneur who strives to do everything by himself and uses others' contribution only in exceptional cases, paying for it when needed. The opportunity to increase agricultural cooperation should be further explored, especially where access to equipment or expensive investments are needed.

Currently, in the absence of significant funding from external donors, the only communication activities aimed at advertising the offer and recruiting new students is entrusted to the Archdiocese, this mainly consists in the pastoral activities carried out by the priest in charge of the centre and of the Archdiocese youth policies. The effectiveness of this activity, that allows saturation of the courses with the number of

candidates corresponding roughly to the overall availability, must certainly be recognized. It is however essential to strengthen the promotion, not only because in order for the CRAS to work efficiently it must be able to intercept a significant demand and a steady stream of students, but also because it must be able to start a selection of its users on the basis of quality criteria and potential. The current definition has limitations.

The CRAS centre is on the whole a good and very well equipped company, with many possibilities of optimization and expansion. Many of its activities, whether for training, production or provision of services, can still be improved and made more efficient. In addition, there is still plenty of space and the possibility to add to the facilities already created other activities that, starting from the availability of means and resources that already exist to creating new opportunities (see the judgment under the heading "impact").

Although COPE has not succeeded in making the centre sustainable until now, it has been able to set up the system during these years. Apart from the funding received from the EC for the expansion of the activities of the centre, COPE has launched other initiatives in the area, in particular, has contributed to the creation and management of a nursery school and a health dispensary to be inaugurated a few weeks after the finalization of the mission, which took place in May 2012. Among other collaborations that the CRAS has been able to promote, there is a noteworthy synergy with Slow Food Italy for the realization of collective gardens for the use of seeds and endogenous plants. Although the initiative does not constitute a relevant source of revenue, it represents an important opportunity through which the centre and its targeted area enter into interesting circuits for the enhancement of food production attentive to biodiversity values.

Impact and sustainability

Rating Impact: "B"

The CRAS has certainly been able to generate a virtuous circle in recent years and a gain in the region, but unfortunately there is no aggregated data that will enable the quantification of benefits produced. Through its training activities and especially its credit access, the centre has meant that several former students have become small business owners within a few years, growing crops, tending fields and developing an entrepreneurial culture that allows them to imagine their own economic emancipation on several fronts instead of one. The more convincing testimonies and success stories tell, in fact, of young people who came to the centre to learn or to improve their skills on a specific sector, were fascinated by the diversified potentialities the context gave them and ended up involving themselves in various activities, some in cultivation some in farming and often different from those they had originally supposed.

In the absence of a quantitative data monitoring system adequately articulated, it was not possible to inscribe the best practices noted within a statistical and quantitative framework able to measure objectively and accurately the success of micro-entrepreneurial activities promoted and accompanied by project activities. The intersection of microcredit data with the qualitative evidences observed during the mission would suggest a level of success that exceeds 50%, however this is only estimation, although probable.

Through, among other things, the mass distribution of seeds, livestock or even tools, the project can produce development without causing distortions to the local context. It bases its assumptions on the agricultural vocation and on the resilient will of beneficiaries taking an active part in the emancipation processes, in which the project intends to involve them and make them congregate. The project therefore opens prospects for sustainable and not harmful development compared to structures and endogenous and traditional balances.

The administrations of the village, “ward”² and District, relevant ministries (Education and Agriculture), and all the organizations with which the centre maintains functional relationships have expressed a highly positive impact of the CRAS.

The CRAS still shows high potential, currently underused and ready to be exploited:

- in terms of its ability to direct production, both agricultural and zoo-technical;
- on the training side, which can be safely increased (given the availability of underutilized beds);
- in terms of the provision of services, such as the rental of vehicles and machinery, storage of the harvest, the micro finance activities or experimental production of selected crops, such as seeds.

To date, the entity of this potential has not been explored in a systematic way. They emerged clearly during the mission in the course of various individual and group interviews and were then verified in the inspections.

Sustainability Rating: “C”

In terms of financial sustainability of CRAS centre, a lot remains to be accomplished. The centre, by means of the proceeds of the activities, is not able to cover more than a third of the expenditure of the total management and operational costs, amounting to about 90 million shillings per year (about € 45,000 at the time of the evaluation). There are no clear prospects, under the present circumstances, to improve this situation; the weakness of the exit strategy, already identified since the preliminary phase of the evaluation of the project, is at this stage confirmed.

Since 1998 COPE has been demonstrating explicit attention to the area of intervention and, more recently, the NGO set up various solutions to develop activities, building up small infrastructure and entrenching its rural development operations in the Songea District and specifically on the site of action . The largest investment made by COPE in the area is represented by the creation of the CRAS in consortium with Focsiv and the financial support of DGCS, followed by further significant funding from the EC. To date, the COPE continues to manage and support the CRAS with expatriate human resources and current costs coverage. There is no adequate management plan for the centre, able to estimate with sufficient precision the costs, investments and revenues and therefore reliably predict the economic future of the centre. In this regard COPE is today the only institution working to raise funds from other donors and ensuring the management and coverage of current costs.

² The Ward is the "department" or province or administrative district that in Tanzania comprises a number of villages, and is of lower level compared to Districts.

Even the ownership of the centre is now uncertain: the on-site body of reference is the Archdiocese (COPE's formal partner since the beginning of operations of the COPE in Songea) and the Steering Committee members including representatives from the provincial office of farming of Mamtumbo (Ward), regional Office of Agriculture of Songea District and the Mayor of the Village of Msindo. The Archdiocese trusts in the capacity of COPE's fundraising, and is not taking direct charge of the centre.

Even the option of including the CRAS between training centres accredited by the Ministry of Education and the VETA (Vocational Education Training Authority), have not yet been adequately investigated by the competent authority for the accreditation of training institutions more than a year after the conclusion of the project.

This accreditation, in fact, has been under discussion since the project was active but still does not have any formal finding.

Two possible changes seem to show potential:

- One, the complete redefinition of curricula and the complete change of teaching staff (to convert the existing one, which does not have the necessary licenses, would in any case require a long period of training);

- Two, a change of the target of its own users: the school would then form and enable, through more structured and extensive training courses, agricultural technicians and veterinaries destined to public employment rather than working privately.

It seems necessary to create a program that takes into account all the essential elements (ownership, management, services and beneficiaries) organizing them in a way that would guarantee economic and financial sustainability to the project.

Summary Tab

The summary tab of evaluative judgments of the executive summary is here repeated for ease reference

Planning	Relevance Rating: "A" very good	
<p>The project matches the need to improve the rural living conditions by increasing the domestic economy and enhancing opportunities of the Songea District villages, in south Tanzania. The project plan is entirely consistent with the needs of the area and with the rural, agricultural and pastoral vocation primacy. Appropriate concern for development and infrastructural policies as traditionally defined in Tanzania, is conveyed in their general vocation, as agriculture represents the main economic activity of the country, moreover and specifically in the Songea district which is one of the major producers in the region. The training offer responds to the double need of general orientation and of practical and focused skills, paying attention to the technical aspects as well as to the economic side of the rural productive activities. Furthermore the project offers its beneficiaries the access to credit for the start-up and consolidation of small productive or commercial activities.</p>		
	Design quality Rating: "C" problems	
<p>The project plan show significant limits in four crucial aspects: a) the overall timeline to deliver output is manifestly inadequate if compared to the expected results, b) The identification of target and final beneficiaries is not sufficiently clear and precise, c) The objectively verifiable indicators (IOV) are often merely criteria without qualitative and quantitative indication on levels to achieve and on baseline data d) The project lacks a convincing exit strategy or an explicitly defined risk management strategy.</p>		
Specific Objective	Impact Rating: "B" satisfactory Sustainability Rating: "C" problems	Overall Objectives
<p>Multiplying the employment opportunities of about 300 young people and local farmers favouring their work access and improving their entrepreneurial abilities in Songea District.</p>	<p>The project has been able to generate during these years a virtuous circle and a gain in the region. Through its training activity linked to credit access, the CRAS centre (Consorzio Rurale Agro-ecologico of Songea) has turned its students into small entrepreneurs in few years. Unfortunately, there is a lack of a monitoring system allowing the measurement of the micro entrepreneurial activities success involved in the project. The initiative opens spaces for sustainable development and is not harmful to the endogenous and traditional equilibriums. The good reputation of the CRAS centre and of its activities is palpable in the local and national context. There is still significant untapped potential. A strong critical element is represented by the financial sustainability; the centre is currently able to cover only 30% of its costs. Another critical element is the exit strategy, as it is still uncertain whether the centre will be taken in charge from the Archdiocese or if it will be included among the training centres accredited by the Ministry of Education.</p>	<p>Rural poverty factors reduction in Songea District</p>

Results	Effectiveness Rating: “B” satisfactory	Specific Objective
1) CRAS centre building, organization and equipment; 2) agro-zootechnical production and officinal; 3) vocational training; 4) technical and financial (microcredit); 5) consciousness on human promotion and sustainable development.	The variety of good practices and examples confirm how much the integrated and complementary approach between orientation, economic and technical skills, together with microcredit access can be fruitful. The associated and cooperative work, however, has proved to have met some difficulties at implementation level not providing the expected results. The information campaign addressed to recruit new students is inadequate as it is carried out exclusively by the Archdiocese. The CRAS centre is very well equipped and can offer further optimization and extension possibilities. Most of its activities, (training, production or services provision) can be further enhanced and made more efficient. Moreover, there is room to add additional activities to the services already in place, capitalizing on the existing means and resources.	Rural poverty factors reduction in multiplying the employment opportunities of about 300 young people and local farmers favouring their work access and improving their entrepreneurial abilities in Songea District.
Activities	Efficiency Rating: “B” satisfactory	Results
1) training centre building and equipment, waterworks and management system 2) agricultural and zootechnical production 3) training courses, anthropologic studies, seminars 4) technical assistance, microcredit, microenterprise services 5) promotion activity in villages and schools	The project has been realized responsively by COPE staff, which succeeded in ensuring the scheduled activities implementation and problems solving as well as unexpected events. Beyond some delays, the CRAS today is a first class training centre and regarded as a centre of excellence for his architectural, management and logistic quality. The centre is well managed with a very motivated staff. With the exception of microcredit data, it has not been possible to have access to aggregated and updated data, not only on frequencies but also on the rating and follow up of the young micro entrepreneurs that could synthetically give a measure of the effective CRAS performance from the beginning.	1) CRAS centre building, organization and equipment; 2) agro-zootechnical production and officinal; 3) vocational training; 4) technical and financial (microcredit); 5) awareness on human promotion and sustainable development.

Lessons learned and recommendations

The initiative of Focsiv-COPE "Improving Agricultural Situation in Songea District" has all the ingredients of a quintessential rural development project, with a traditional cut aimed at the effective empowerment of the local population with the aim of increasing the efficiency of agricultural and livestock activities in the area. The project, which captures real and absolutely relevant needs, originates from an earlier presidium of the COPE NGO that since 1998 works in conjunction with the Songea's Archdiocese. The process, born with a small investment of the COPE, has reached the current proportions due to the financial support of DGCS, followed by further significant funding from the EC (which ended in 2011), allowing further development of activities for the centre.

To date, the COPE do not obtain dedicated investments from specific projects supporting the management and development of the centre, therefore it refers mostly to internal resources. The centre CRAS, around which gravitate all results and services to which the project has given rise, is now a healthy and active structure, a point of reference not only for the local population and the surrounding territory. Building the future for the CRAS centre is the present challenge, dealing with an issue related to the economic and functional viability of the centre COPE's exit strategy and the actual taking charge of the centre by the local counterparts .

The following recommendations are aimed to consolidate the results of the project:

Recommendation 1 - It 's crucial to process the disaggregated and existing data available in the administrative offices of the CRAS centre, so that the performance of the centre can be estimated in terms of provision of training and satisfaction rating of the students.

Recommendation 2 - It is absolutely necessary to define a business plan and a strategy of financial management for the centre, designing a model and a projection of performance to minimize the dependence of the centre on foreign aid.

Recommendation 3 - It is required to accompany financial management analysis with a study for a communication campaign to attract potential beneficiary students, since the promotional activities of the CRAS can not depend exclusively on the initiative of the head of the Archdiocese; it is essential to involve in this activity other members of the Steering Committee and staff working within the centre.

Recommendation 4- The microcredit component, beyond the modest performance that has been obtained to date, is an important opportunity for users of the courses and more generally for the local context. It is vital to continue to strengthen this strategic tool.

Recommendation 5- The question of ownership of the CRAS centre must be managed more decisively, in view of gradually transferring the financial and management responsibility to the future ownership. This objective needs to identify the path to drive the centre towards one of the following options, or a mix of them:

- COPE intends to remain the leader institution in the management of the centre and in this case is oriented to become in fact a local NGO, progressively managed by local elements;
- The Archdiocese is organized in order to take charge of the centre, of its costs and its potential profitability;
- Local authorities define better their role and responsibilities, sharing the costs of the Centre and influencing its future more directly;
- The CRAS centre will be integrated within the accredited ministerial training centres network (VETA); in this case significant adjustments will be needed.

Recommendation 6 - Define the vocation of CRAS: a) reach the most disadvantaged sections of the population in a perspective of poverty reduction, or, b) refer to groups of most talented young people and strengthening the connective stratum of the healthy and responsive rural context in which the centre operates, giving more emphasis in the latter case to a perspective of development and of local and socio-economic infrastructure.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL REHABILITATION OF
MAASAI'S PASTORAL AREAS IN THE ARUMERU DISTRICT
OIKOS PROJECT AID N° 8152**

PROJECT DATA

Title	“Economic development and environmental rehabilitation of Maasai’s pastoral areas in the Arumeru District”
AID n°	8152
NGO	Oikos
Total budget (€)	Euro 1.577.788
DGCS (€) funding	Euro 773.409
Place	Northern Tanzania - Masai Steppe - District of Meru. As a result of administrative changes took place in 2007 the District of Arumeru is split into two districts: Arusha and Meru.
Partners	District of Arumeru, University of Insubria
Sector	DAC Code 41010 - Environmental Policy and Administrative Management
Starting date	01/07/2007
Ending date	30/06/2010 (scheduled) 30/09/2010 (real)
Duration (scheduled and real)	36 (scheduled) 39 (real)
Brief description of the Project	The project aims to support local communities, Maasai Warumeru and Warusha, in close cooperation with the authorities of the Arumeru District, to improve their living standards by identifying and testing new models and approaches to land management, based on local culture and traditions, responding to the changes taking place in the economic and social context and processed on the basis of the opportunities offered by the most recent national and international policies in the field of participatory management and sustainable use of natural resources and livestock.

Relevance and quality of design

Rating Relevance: "A"

The project addresses significant issues in the pertinent area. Its relevance to the needs is substantiated both in the approach and in the matter addressed. The intervention contributes to the creation of equilibrium in a fragile ecosystem which originally very rich in terms of natural resources and biodiversity, is now under threat of desertification. The selected activities act on the problem of increasing anthropic and the delicate structuring of the socio-economic and cultural assets of local communities (belonging mostly to different ethnic groups Wameru, Maasai and Warusha). Improve the standard of living and support the sustainable development of local communities in demographic growth through the identification and testing of new strategies and participatory models of land management is at the core of the design intent.

The project results in line with the United Republic of Tanzania policy and seizes the opportunities offered by international and national policies in the field of participatory management of the territory. Moreover it is coherent and instrumental to the efficient implementation of the Wildlife Policy of Tanzania of 1998 and consequent implementing regulations, including the establishment of Wildlife Management Areas. Furthermore it has been functional to the laborious process, launched in 2004 by the Tanzanian government, concerning spatial planning and recording competences and pertinence at district level, demarcation of administrative boundaries between ward (provinces) and villages, in particular contributing to the definition of five territorial Village plans (Land Use Plans - LUP).

Consistent with its mission which focuses on the protection of biodiversity and the sustainable use of natural resources, the project sponsored by Oikos favours a holistic approach, in which the access to natural resources (primarily water, but also the fertile land, firewood, grazing, game and other products of the forest or steppe) is inseparably connected with the increasing demand for governance by different stakeholders, and more generally with the need to insert the satisfaction of the legitimate interests in a broad and planned mechanism for participatory management of the territory. From the strengthening of the institutional capacity of the district (Wilaya), to the production and accessibility of spatial data, from the strengthening of economic and technical skills of the local population to raise awareness of all segments of the local communities on the responsible and sustainable use of natural resources, the original conception of the project expresses in clear and explicit terms, its vocation to a systemic approach, in the full awareness that the interventions within a specific sector or department have always important effects and repercussions on all the others.

The project shows two other complementary strengths to specific areas of its intervention logic. On the one hand, the Oikos presence since 1996 in the area chosen for the intervention, with the dowry of his previous initiatives (notably the Mkuru Training Centre - MTU, a rural training centre previous to the project which is

a reference point essential for many of its activities). On the other hand, the strong complementarities with other initiatives that the Institute Oikos made coexist with project activities or kept active until now (and that during the mission have been appreciated); these, acting in related or complementary fields, contribute to the consistency and persistence of the benefits produced by the project.

“C” Rating Design Quality: “C”

In the design phase the holistic approach adopted was not properly combined with rigorous and more consistent intervention logic; this results in fact redundant and dispersive in various aspects. The original definition of the project expresses five specific objectives - the literature recommends only one per project - to which consequently correspond the related batteries of results, which are 20 in total. The 26 activities mentioned in the logical framework matrix are directly related to the objectives and are not (as they should be) an effective logic declination of the results, but rather their substantial repetition³.

The accuracy level of the objectively verifiable indicators (IOVs) is modest: first of all, they are poorly quantifiable, being essentially parameters and not real indicators and lacking, most of the time, the departure numerical value and the desired one of arrival. In addition, although considerable effort is made to describe the potential areas in which some SMART indicators could be applied - especially for wildlife and forestry issues - even where an excellent job has been done to gather baseline data, in the project there is a lack, mainly because it requires longer times compared to the time required for environmental assessments - of a comprehensive system of monitoring and detection able to verify the performance achieved and any difference with those expected.

In the description of the project and in the declining of its logic of intervention, especially regarding the first two specific objectives, the emphasis falls on the transfer of technical and scientific skills to local authorities and on issues related to the production of data (computer programs, geographic information systems, databases, maps, topography, etc.). These areas leave behind - and indeed sometimes put among the external conditions - the proved crucial aspects of mediation and conflict resolution, underestimating the political, procedural, historical, cultural and negotiation aspects typical of the participatory management of the territory. The poor consideration of these aspects in the design phase has been detrimental in terms of efficiency and effectiveness of activities and results.

³ In the ordinary formulation of the Logic Framework matrix (LFM) each result should be a number of activities (never just one) that allows to appreciate the translation into practice and functionality of the intervention logic.

Efficiency and effectiveness

Efficiency Rating: “B”

The on-site surveys and consulted documentation show that the project was carried out in an efficient manner compared to its scheduled timing and expenditure. In April 2008, the Oikos Institute requested a variation in order to adapt to changes occurred in the context during the long period of project appraisal at the DGCS (the project was approved the 20th of December 2004, but actually started in July 2007). The changes, approved by the DGCS, consisted of a three-month extension on the timing and the change of institutional structure (the Arumeru District has been transformed into two separate districts of Arusha and Meru); they did not affect the activities of the project.

From what can be inferred in the project documents, the technical and administrative means and resources were generally available at the expected costs and time. The resources were managed in a transparent way and the procedures analysed were consistent with the current rules and regulations.

The high quality of inputs spread by the project, both in terms of qualified human resources and in the quality and accuracy of supplies and materials selected and implemented should be noted.

Another very positive aspect is the good balance in the distribution of input between the different categories of beneficiaries, sub-villages and the identified tribal identities. Although in its original formulation the project emphasized the Maasai ethnic group as a privileged object of intervention, given the vulnerability of this ethnic group compared to the others, the intervention has been able in practice to conduct a fair and equal dialogue with other villages and other ethnic groups, making local authorities adopt its inputs and services in a transparent way, thus avoiding the emergence of tensions always latent among different categories of beneficiaries.

The excellent relationship of respect and trust that exists between project staff and local counterparts, both at different levels of interested institutions (directly observed between sub villages, village, ward and district or province), and between the various categories of beneficiaries directly and differently involved in the activities should also be reported.

The staff of the project has proposed and accompanied with great sensitivity the planned processes of change that have significant impact on the local population, avoiding snags and impositions, and not favouring destabilizing drifts for the delicate local balances, always respecting the authority of the local leadership, even if not in a passive way.

Some problems in the technical process of definition of LUP have been encountered during the development of project activities; in the design phase everything to do with the transfer of skills and the necessary technological infrastructure, the procurement, transfer and release of data was carefully planned but little had been

provided regarding local tensions and quarrels about the right of use and possession of the land and other natural resources. The project activities had to include the management of conflict between sub villages, ethnic groups and different interests expressed by the entities that manage nature reserves, in this case the Arusha National Park. To cope with these unexpected issues, the project staff has shown flexibility and perseverance. Nevertheless, in the end it was able to complete the process only for the LUP of the village Uwiro, compared to the five LUP originally planned.

All other expected outputs of the project not only are achieved but are still visible and found during the inspections and visits. In particular:

- the process for the implementation of LUP is proceeding in the District of Meru, which has the necessary skills and equipment, and has in the meantime realized two other LUP in the villages of Maweni and Karankai;
- the groups that manage the Mkuru Camel Safari and the Maasai Women Art are still in place and in grow, despite the various hardships and difficulties they have faced over the years;
- the team of veterinarians, the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW), is still active and of the 13 trained about half still practice the profession;
- the team of 12 Village Game Scouts (VGS) is still up and about half of them continue to operate, although there are many problems in the quality and survival of their services;
- water-related infrastructure have given tremendous benefits to the local population, their livestock and wild fauna and flora: 11 watering points realized and two earth dams rehabilitated, for a total volume of water equal to 18,500 cubic meters, able to meet the needs of 39,000 heads of cattle, 85 kilometres of gravity aqueducts, using 6 sources and 2 wells with a benefit for approximately 17,600 people, interventions to slow the water flow along the course of temporary rivers and reduce 'soil erosion.

The outputs of the project present a relationship of synergy with other initiatives in the area, especially with some promoted by the Oikos Institute; it is the case of small infrastructure in place for some public utility buildings such as schools, water points, planting of trees, photovoltaic panels supply, installation of games for children, and, in particular, of the Mkuru Training Camp (MTC) with its exemplary set up and its effective management has been a model and the point of reference for the project, the village of Uwiro and the District.

Effectiveness Rating: "B"

From the qualitative point of view, the results are generally very positive and constitute for the beneficiary and local authorities an important example of growth and improvement of the economic situation and local living conditions, as well as an increase of the widespread possibility of influencing the safeguarding of the delicate habitat. In particular:

- the realization of the LUP (the one actually realized by the project and the other two that followed) makes it possible for the villages involved to share

further development opportunities and investments both from the Tanzanian government and from other stakeholders and international donors;

- the launch of economic activities, the Mkuru Camel Safari and the Maasai Women Art represented, albeit some difficulties in making these realities take off in a solid and permanent way, is a concrete example of labour inclusion and sustainable economic integration for young people and women of local communities, thanks to the very professional supervision of other Italian skills, including the collaboration with the European Institute of Design;
- the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) team, beyond the still present weaknesses, has equipped the villages with a highly required service, given the impact of farming in the region and in particular among the Maasai people;
- the Village Game Scout (VGS) team contributed to the increase of widespread sensitiveness towards environment protection and in reproducing responsible behaviours towards the flora, fauna and water resources of the area;
- the small infrastructures, in particular those in charge of making water accessible to villages, schools, or beverage points have greatly improved the quality of life in villages and schools concerned, in particular women, children and farmers directly affected.

The already mentioned weakness of indicators provided during the programming phase and never updated, makes the full understanding of the achievements not possible. In addition an objective and measurable countercheck of their concrete impact on beneficiaries compared with the objectives is also not possible. In contrast, the evaluation mission finds no doubt that a significant portion of the final beneficiaries has had and still has access to the benefits derived from the project results. The Mkuru Camel Safari currently counts on the direct participation of 25 members, mostly young people belonging to different ethnic groups, while the Maasai Women Art has 138 Maasai women and their number is constantly growing, as is their turnover, thanks to connections created with the private sector and with a network of e-commerce.

In spite of this, the component of the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) and the Village Game Scouts (VGS) express certain fragility, due to the fact that both of these components were not sufficiently articulated in a perspective of real sustainability. This is mainly due to the relative dispersion of the intervention logic that opened too many fronts without being able to make them all safe. It should be noted however that, despite the lack of a sound strategy for consolidation or institutionalization of these services, during the mission, then at a distance of about 20 months after the end of the project, most of these people continued to work and had not lost their enthusiasm and status, as well as the belief of playing an important and useful function for their own communities.

Impact and sustainability

Impact Rating: "B"

On the whole, the project has made a significant contribution to the on-going process in Tanzania of decentralization of land management which aims, on the one hand, to make the Districts the referees on issues of environmental management and, on the other, to assign specific tasks of territorial planning to the villages to be implemented in line with the Districts.

Unfortunately, due to the poor arrangement of the objectively verifiable indicators (IOV), it has not been possible to objectively document the positive impact the project has concretely produced. The affected areas are the maintenance and increase of wild fauna and high vegetation, improvement of living conditions of the local population, through the increase of its economic conditions and better assistance in some of its basic needs (among others liveableness in schools, veterinary care, the access to water, care for the environment, the availability of green and shaded areas, the increase and the return of wildlife and biodiversity) and access to natural resources (wood, water, game, pastures and fertile land).

Significant data to demonstrate the project impact is that from its conclusion to date another two LUP were made by the District of Meru, in the villages of Maweni and Karankai. This is certainly an excellent response and proof of the fact that, regardless of the actual performance of the project, the territorial planning is a requirement which districts must be able to respond to. But this is a new awareness and a process still in its early stages. In the Meru District, uncertainty still surrounds the actual use of the methodologies adopted in the planning, despite the genuine enthusiasm of some of the officials interviewed. Of the 72 villages in the District, only 3 are now equipped with a LUP, there is still a long way to go⁴. Beyond the statements of fact, the process is not on the top of the agenda of local governments, neither in terms of investment nor in terms of human resources actually employed.

The project impact is evident in the institutional strengthening at the level of technical staff and officials that in the talks expressed very aptly the benefits and opportunities associated with these activities of negotiated planning, of which the importance is proportional to enormous problems related to the deployment of often divergent local interests.

The project demonstrated sensitivity unusual in the will to preserve the local environment from the risk of an abrupt and destabilizing contact with indiscriminate tourist flows. Local communities, in particular ethnic Maasai, seem currently willing and able to manage, rather than be subjected to, the moderate increase of the attendance produced by the project, which in some of its components - the Mkuru

According to the attestation of the officials in charge for the District of Meru, on 69 villages still without LUP about 30% do not present particular problems in the process while another 30% have a particularly complicated situation to be solved, usually because of the nearness of the village borders with other jurisdictions, whether they belong to another district or to the Arusha National Park.

Camel Safari and the Maasai Women Art - refers to the tourist exploitation of the area and of the local culture.

An indirect result produced by the project and which deserves to be mentioned is the growth and consolidation of Oikos East Africa that, established in 2008, in recent years has been consolidated as an independent entity and as an authoritative and reliable local NGO that enjoys an excellent reputation in the north of Tanzania , resulting in the strengthening of the Italian system image as a whole in the country.

Sustainability Rating: “B”

The existence of practically all the benefits produced by the project 20 months after its conclusion, is a clear indicator of sustainability. This performance is not, however, homogeneous and presents different declinations:

- the Masai women’s craft activities - Masai Women Art - are consolidated and the marketing chain is in a stabilization phase both in Arusha and through the website <http://www.tanzaniamaasaiwomenart.com/>;
- the Mkuru Camel Safari services- visited during the low season - are in a slight increase even if due to insufficient management skills and marketing the activity has not had the hoped for take-off since the end of the project to date ;
- the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) are still active although claiming various weaknesses in their ability to provide the service, such as the difficult mobility and insufficient expertise in treating certain disorders;
- The Village Game Scouts (VGS) continue to offer their voluntary service for at least one day a week, which coincides with the availability for community work according to the duties of the community and the traditional assets, and two of them have been recruited by the American and prestigious African Wildlife Foundation that deals with the management of nature reserves in Tanzania.

Consistent with its intent, the project ensures the utmost attention to meet as far as possible the environmental sustainability criteria. All its activities aim at preserving the environment, minimizing the negative impact produced by atrophic activities, informing the local population of behaviour more respectful of the environment, even and especially where traditional practices or their most recent evolutions prove to be harmful or not environmentally sustainable. In particular, the economic activities the project helped to create for women are addressed primarily to divert them from the wood collection for the production of charcoal sold for domestic use. The activities of the Village Game Scouts are entirely aimed at preventing and deterring poaching, collection of fresh wood and other prejudicial behaviours against flora and wildlife.

In the current state, Oikos is, above all through its Mkuru Training Centre (MTU), an essential defence and reference point for the whole area and especially the Maasai community. The success of the project, in particular, in the village of Uwiro, the only village in which the project was able to finalize the LUP, is explained by the chairman of the Village, as linked to the existence of that area in which the local population is able to gather and place in a climate of peaceful and constructive dialogue. Up to now, it is clear that the possible withdrawal of Oikos from the area would result in a drastic stall of the process launched by the project and in an evident reduction of the outputs produced. The project has therefore been able to activate processes of medium and long term that require some form of

accompaniment that Oikos is trying to do through self-promoted activities or by finding other funds.

Summary Tab

The summary tab of evaluative judgments of the executive summary is here repeated for ease reference

Design	Relevance Rating: "A" very good	
<p>The project deals with relevant issues of the Arumeu District. Its relevance, compared to the needs encountered, is very much perceptible, regarding simultaneously the approach and the content. The chosen activities deal with the phenomenon of progressive anthropic settlement of the area and the delicate evolution of socio-economic and cultural structures of local communities, in order to support their sustainable development. The project is in line with other policies promoted by the Government of Tanzania in the area concerning spatial planning and natural resources conservation. The project deals with different aspects linked to the development and rehabilitation of the territory following an integrated approach to foster the necessary synergies between different interventions, taking care at the same time of the involvement of various stakeholders, not only at the operational level, but also in the governance.</p>		
<p style="text-align: center;">Quality of design Rating: "C" problems</p>		
<p>The intervention logic results partly dispersed, starting with the five specific objectives, each of which corresponds to a battery of results (20 in total) and 26 activities, not always directly linked to the results. The level of accuracy of the objectively verifiable indicators (IOVs) is modest. Especially in the first two specific objectives, the emphasis falls on the transfer of technical and scientific skills to local authorities and on issues related to the production of data, leaving behind aspects of mediation and conflict resolution, which are central elements of participatory territorial management. The limited consideration of these aspects in the design phase is a critical issue in terms of efficiency and effectiveness of activities and results.</p>		
Specific Objectives	Impact Rating: "B" satisfactory Sustainability Rating: "B" problems	Overall objective
<p>1) Strengthen the capacity of Meru District to plan and manage natural resources. 2) Support the Maasai community of the District of Meru in preparation of Territorial Village Plans. 3) Improving the skills and operational capacity of the Maasai community to protect and manage their livestock and environmental resources. 4) Enhance the quality, values and abilities of economic and sustainable use of environmental resources. 5) Increase the sensitivity and awareness of the international community on the issues of sustainable economic growth.</p>	<p>The project has given an important contribution to the on-going decentralization process of the territorial management in Tanzania. Various counterchecks demonstrate a positive impact on the maintenance and increase of wildlife, high vegetation and an improvement of the living conditions of the local population. From the project's conclusion to date, the Meru District has approved two other <i>Land Use Plan</i> (LUP), confirming the on-going need for a planning by the entities and officials in charge, not yet completely understood by local administrations. The benefits produced by the project are palpable, present and active even after two years, with help of Oikos that in a moderate and indirect way sustain a certain number of small organizations, like the Maasai women's craft activities, Mkuru Camel Safari tourist services, the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) and the Village Game Scout (VGS) activities. Oikos represents, mostly through its Mkuru Training Centre (MTU), an essential protection and a reference point for the whole area, and especially for the Maasai community. The unlikely draw back of Oikos from the area, without a clear and shared exit strategy, would determine in any case a drastic stall in the process launched by the project and an evident reduction of the outputs.</p>	<p>Supporting the Maasai communities, in close cooperation with the Ameru District authorities, to improve their living condition through the identification and experimentation of new strategies and territorial management models, founded on local traditions and culture, responding to the on-going evolutions of the economic and social context and created on the basis of the opportunities offered by the most recent national and International policies concerning the sustainable and participatory management of the natural and zoo-technical resources.</p>

Results	Effectiveness Rating: "B" satisfactory	Specific Objectives
<p>1) Launch of the office, technical skills development, basic information collection, databases, decision-making support system.</p> <p>2) agreements, information, territorial planning, collaborations.</p> <p>3) improvement of the health of the livestock, the Maasai knowledge in relation to their environmental heritage and to the proper management of natural resources.</p> <p>4) availability of pools of water, veterinary care, anti-poaching units, environmental rehabilitation, responsible tourism.</p> <p>5) technical brochure and publicity material , events.</p>	<p>The results achieved are generally very positive and constitute for the beneficiary and local authorities an important example of growth and improvement of the economic situation and local living conditions, as well as an increase of the widespread possibility of influencing the safeguarding of the delicate habitat.</p> <p>The implementation of the Uwiro LUP represents a significant model for participatory planning in the region. In contrast, a significant portion of the final beneficiaries does not have access to the benefits derived from the project results. The Mkuru Camel Safari currently has the direct participation of 25 members, mostly young people from different ethnic groups and the Maasai Women Art has 138 Maasai women and their number is constantly growing, as well as their sales, thanks to connections created with the private sector and with a network of e-commerce. Both the component of the Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) and that of Village Game Scouts (VGS) continue to be active, although they express certain fragility, due to the fact that both of these components were not sufficiently articulated in a perspective of real sustainability.</p>	<p>1) Strengthen the capacity of Meru District to plan and manage natural resources.</p> <p>2) Support the Maasai community of the District of Meru in preparation of Territorial Village Plans.</p> <p>3) Improving the skills and operational capacity of the Maasai community to protect and manage their livestock and environmental resources.</p> <p>4) Enhance the quality, values and abilities of economic and sustainable use of environmental resources.</p> <p>5) Increase the understanding and awareness of the international community on the issues of sustainable economic growth.</p>
Activities	Efficiency Rating: "B" satisfactory	Results
<p>A) Start-up activities of the project (1, 2 and 3). B) planning office, 2 GIS unity(4), vocational training(5), collection of information(6), GIS archive (7), decision-making support system(8). C) dialogue (9), collection of information(10), GIS data organization (11) territorial plans(12) meetings and workshop (13). D) vocational training for community members on the zoo-technical heritage (14) and on preservation and management techniques of the natural resources(15) meeting to raise the communitarian sensitization (16). E) hydraulic micro-intervention(17), veterinary structure(18) anti-poaching unit(19) environmental rehabilitation(20) cultural tourism (21). F) technical brochure and publicity material (22), monograph on Maasai(23), projects closing activities (24-26).</p>	<p>The project has been carried out in an efficient manner respecting the scheduled timing and expenditure, in compliance with description of the project.</p> <p>The high quality of inputs spread by the project is remarkable, both in terms of qualified human resources and in the quality and accuracy of supplies and materials selected and implemented.</p> <p>The good balance of distribution of input between the different categories of beneficiaries, the excellent relationship between project staff and local counterparts, and a proper care in proposing and accompanying the planned shift processes without pandering destabilizing tendencies, are all positive factors emerged during the mission.</p> <p>The reporting and internal monitoring system of the project are adequate, with good outreach capacity compared to the project results. The greatest problems faced by project activities concerned the technical process for the definition of the LUP, because of the conflict between different interests expressed by local stakeholders including those of the institutions managing nature reserves. They have been able to complete the process for only the LUP of the village of Uwiro, compared to the five originally planned. All other outputs are realized and visible.</p>	<p>1) Launch of the office, technical skills development, basic information collection, databases, decision-making support system.</p> <p>2) agreements, information, territorial planning, collaborations.</p> <p>3) improvement of the health of the livestock, the Maasai knowledge in relation to their environmental heritage and to the proper management of natural resources.</p> <p>4) availability of pools of water, veterinary care, anti-poaching units, environmental rehabilitation, responsible tourism.</p> <p>5) technical brochure and publicity material , events.</p>

Lessons learned and recommendations

The project “Economic development and environmental rehabilitation of Maasai’s pastoral areas in the Arumeru District” is a very relevant initiative compared both to the needs and local policies, as well as to the importance of the issues to be dealt with.

Its holistic approach, although it exposes the original formulation of the project to the risk of being dispersive, proves to be able to go with good interconnection among apparently separated domains, such as the economic inclusion of vulnerable population, the maintenance of a sustainable lifestyle consistent with the traditional values, the new urgent demands for planning, the sustainable use of natural resources, the optimized access to water by farmers and families in general, the relationship among protected areas and nature reserves, relations with the international tourist flows, the maintenance of relations between different ethnic groups and inter-institutional relations between the various levels of local government bodies.

The direct observation of the effects produced by the project and generally thanks to the presence of the Oikos Institute in the area, makes evident the efficiency and the positive impact derived from the planned activities, even if the indicators’ set originally provided and then concretely monitored do not allow an objective appreciation of its extent and size.

Notwithstanding the overall good performance of the project, the Oikos intervention in the area cannot be ended. As often happens with successful projects, the initiative supported by DGCS has produced a positive impact and contributed to raising new and further expectations and needs in the population and in the local government system, giving birth to a demand that today needs further external help.

In light of the above, the following considerations and recommendations are made:

Recommendation 1 - The structure created by Oikos, through specific activities of the project and other interventions, is able today to capitalize on the existing resources and generate a strong impact handling new and eventual small investments. A micro-intervention program sustaining what was produced by the project, would be of great interest and would produce very positive results with low investments.

Recommendation 2 - The experience engendered by the project has provided the basis for a work much more focused on the strengthening of local governance. A work which aims to recognise and enhance the management abilities as much in the economic activities (the women’s group, the Camel Safari cooperative) and in the territorial services (Community Animal Health Workers (CAHW) and Village Game Scout (VGS)), as in the various government levels (sub-villages, Villages, Ward, District) capitalizing on what has been done to date and consolidating the benefits produced by the project in a determinant way

Recommendation 3 - The women Maasai’s craft activity represents, notwithstanding some limits, a good practice and an encouraging example of a concrete and possible empowerment process. As these women are an organized group able to produce savings, we recommend the experimentation with them of the microfinance basic practices, to make them even more independent and more aware of their economic status at the communitarian level.

Recommendation 4 - We recommend Oikos to evaluate the two LUPs realized in the Meru District in full-autonomy and regardless of the project activities for the Maweni and Karankai villages. This would result in indirect impact indicators of the work done in the Meru District and a starting point for the identification of further strengthening domains of the institutional abilities.

REHABILITATION OF THE ENDEMIC DISEASES MONITORING SYSTEM OF THE NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICE IN THE ZANZIBAR ARCHIPELAGO - TANZANIA (SISME) - IVO DE CARNERI FOUNDATION'S PROJECT AID N° 8895

PROJECT DATA

Title	Rehabilitation of the Endemic Diseases Monitoring System of the National Health Service in the Zanzibar Archipelago - Tanzania (SISME)
AID n°	8895
NGO	Ivo de Carneri Foundation(FdC)
Total budget (€)	340.010
DGCS (€) funding	238.000
Place	Zanzibar Archipelago- United Republic of Tanzania
Partners	Ministry of Health and Social Welfare (MoHSW)
Sector	DAC code 121 "Health General"
Starting date	01/02/2009
Ending date	31/01/2010 (scheduled) 31/07/2010 (real)
Duration (scheduled and real)	12 months (scheduled), 19 (real)
Brief description of the Project	The project aims at rehabilitating the surveillance system of endemic diseases and of epidemics by strengthening the central role of the Public Health Laboratory (PHL) Ivo De Carneri and of the Health Districts structures through supplies, equipment, and means for the health data collection and the training of human resources in the epidemiologic surveillance domain. The main achievements consisted in 1) the strengthening of the Ministerial Office of Pemba's Zone thanks to the collocation of the HMIS Operative Unit (Health Management Information System) in the PHL; 2) the training of skilled human resources in the epidemiology surveillance; 3) the strengthening of Health Districts structures through the supply of the equipment and means for the collection and analysis of health data.

Relevance and quality of the design

Rating Relevance: “B”

The commitment of the Ivo de Carneri Foundation (IdC) starts with an agreement between the foundation and the Ministry of Health and Social Welfare (MoHSW) of Zanzibar, that is dated 1997 and that gave birth to the building of the Public Health Laboratory (PHL), which officially opened in June 2000.

The SISME project, (Rehabilitation of the Surveillance System for the endemic diseases of the National Health Service in the Zanzibar- Tanzania) wants to contribute to the Health Management Information System (HMIS) reform that, in September 2005, the Zanzibar Health Ministry launched, in cooperation with DANIDA (Danish Governmental Cooperation) and with HISP (Health Information System Program), an European network for the enhancement of the Informatics' Systems in Africa. The need to rehabilitate the epidemics surveillance system origins from the urgency of improving the system of collection, re-elaboration, analysis, interpretation and publication of data, to which follows the distribution of collected information to everyone needing to be informed in order to plan with full knowledge and in a focused manner, the prevention and check-up campaigns of the endemic and epidemic diseases.

In addition to being in line with the health governmental policies priorities, the action is consistent with the commitment of the Italian Cooperation in Tanzania and in particular in Zanzibar where DGCS has launched, during the same years, further initiatives in the health sector that, lead by an indirect management, constituted relevant support for the PHL Laboratory of Pemba, mostly through the indirect management of the project AID 9156. Other areas covered by this action were the training of health personnel, the provision of scholarships and medical equipment, conduction of surveys on morbidity of some diseases (including dengue) and support of the health capacities of ZAMREC, Zanzibar Medical Research Ethical Committee and the bioethical Committee in Zanzibar.

The need to strengthen the data collection system is a priority for the public health system in Zanzibar, which operates under more favourable conditions than the rest of the health system in Tanzania. Zanzibar is characterized by a good network of health services, 90% of the population (about one million people on the two islands) lives within 5 kilometres of a health centre, a Public Health Centre Unit (PHCU) or a Cottage Hospital and the catchment area is estimated at 5000-6000 people per basic health centre and 15,000 persons for each hospital. The accessibility to services and the fact of being an island and therefore being relatively isolated, makes the context particularly favourable and suitable for experiments to improve the health care planning and preventive system. Of course, in this context of easier manageability (the whole Zanzibar system has proportions similar to those of a large Italian Local Health Authority), the potential positive effects of the efficient use of data and of the information system, even if of relevant impact on prevention and on a more effective planning and management of services and investment, are not always recognized as a priority by the resident population, more inclined to prefer health services immediately direct to the person.

The information system is not always recognized, neither in the ordinary management nor in the current operation of the services and even within the government network of

services, as a priority and urgent in relation to all the deficiencies and emergencies the Zanzibar system has to face (availability of qualified human resources, supply of drugs, management of emergencies system, etc.).

Rating Design Quality: “B”

The project logic can be better appreciated referring to the processes that the Ivo de Carneri foundation had previously started. During the preliminary investigation, the duration of the project was originally scheduled for three years while during the effective approval phase was then decided to intervene for one year, without proportionately reducing the project ambitions. Therefore the project was clearly underpowered in relation to the timing, which was then extended to seven months through a request for extension submitted to the Foundation and then approved by DGCS in December 2009, as well as the preparation of a further three-year period that has actually followed the project object of this evaluation.

The three expected results of the project, the location of the Unit of HMIS at the PHL, the staff epidemiological surveillance training and the strengthening of the Health Districts structures network are three steps functional and consistent with the achievement of the specific objective of the project, together with the timely identification of beneficiaries, about 500 health professionals, active in dispensaries, districts and hospitals.

Efficiency and effectiveness

Rating Efficiency: “B”

Most of the project activities have been realized within the scheduled time and an extension of seven months has been granted in order to overcome some minor difficulties linked at first to the delayed response of the HMIS, caused by some initial resistance from its executives, as well as by the need for supplementary staff training courses, the completion of which provoked the necessity for the extension.

The supply of equipment to the PHL and to the Health Districts was effected without any particular problems and PHL staff proved to be motivated and efficient in the project activities realization.

An aspect that reduced the potentiality of the information system is related to the difficulties in virtual and material connections between the PHL and the Districts, caused by problems in the hedging of the telephone network and the lack of staff transport.

Another contingent aspect affecting the project results is the fact that MoHSW staff wages of the Revolutionary Republic of Zanzibar are, on the average, half of those

earned by the MoH in the rest of Tanzania⁵. This situation discourages qualified personnel from starting a career with the Ministry with obvious negative consequences on the system; naturally, qualified staff favour a move towards better career opportunities and higher salaries and therefore, away from the project.

Another aspect partially linked to the one above and decisively affecting the project's effectiveness is the *Top up Allowance* (TuA) system, consisting in making project activities work on a basis of customary attribution of extraordinary fees to the staff of the Ministry directly involved. This form of incentive, spread out among different NGOs and international organizations working in Tanzania, tends to make the participation and involvement of local staff dependent on the availability of funds produced by the projects, resulting in a complementary and indirect effect of disinterest in the project's defined activities as unless they are classified as extraordinary, are not financed by projects funds. This issue is often debated during coordination rounds and among International actors working in Tanzania, without bringing an univocal and shared solution (please see also in this regard to the Sustainability section).

The PHL employs a permanent staff of 50 employees of which 90% are paid by the MoHSW and another 300 people are paid on the basis of project funds and necessities. The PHL approach is essentially *demand-based*, that means it is centred on the determination of its own working activities on the basis of the services supply demand or on the National and International institutions' requests. The PHL does not succeed in being sustainable or in justifying its functioning without the realization of costly projects that require employment of funds other than the ordinary ones provided by the Ministry.

The training has been completely realized with participation higher than expected, involving about 526 health care operators having 36 days of training. The staff had some minor difficulties concerning the forecast of allowances and travel costs and some inconvenience in order to attend the compact courses lasting 4-10 days. In order to compensate some unsatisfactory qualitative results, and intending to transfer adequate skills so that trained staff could really produce qualitatively reliable data, instead of the 4 courses initially planned, the IdC Foundation decided to implement 7 courses. Due to some delays in the launch of the project, the first epidemiology basic-course originally scheduled was implemented by DANIDA and then substituted with a more specific one on adult epidemiology.

With regard to the qualitative achievements, the training acknowledgements have been lower than desired due to the beneficiaries' poor basic skills. Currently, the introduction to statistical and informatics aspects present in the CVs of the institution giving training to health care operators in Tanzania is unsatisfactory. Consequently, the management abilities of the Districts involved in the program, the accuracy of collected data and the monitoring system are of a lower quality than expected, despite the quality and the numbers of courses provided is consistent with what was originally planned. This is the main reason why the IdC Foundation decided to provide further training opportunities within the project, and at the same time, presenting another three-year project composing the second phase (SISME II phase AID 9545, 2011-2014 with a total cost of about 1,2 millions of euro).

⁵ Even being part of the Tanzanian State since 1964, the Revolutionary Republic of Zanzibar has its own administrative political system, including a government, its own Parliament, President and also a Constitution.

Rating effectiveness: “B”

The strengthening of the Ministerial Office of Pemba through the Operative Unit HMIS collocation in the Public Health Laboratory (OHL-IdC) represents one of the main achievements of the project. This logistic change that initially caused some resistance in the Operative Unit executives, has in the medium term provided the basis for effective systematic data collection, being the PHL situated in Chake Chake and then more centrally on the island and potentially equidistant to the various Health Districts.

The HMIS data is used by the MoHSW for the periodic publication of reports that the Ministry uses to promote its institutional campaign. The Ministry executives are also aware that the HMIS data serves as an excellent business card to attract new funds and promote constructive dialogue with other potential international donors, as they enable the information sources for production and data on which building strategies, working-hypothesis, planning and future projects can be based.

It is also thanks to the project that today the HMIS vaunt an excellent reputation within the Ministry and the donors involved in the health sector, first of all DANIDA, which is the major donor involved in the health sector in Zanzibar, as reported during the mission and confirmed in the documentation of previous missions.

The PHL (www.phlidc.org), with the tools and equipment at its disposal today thanks to the project, has bought a second-hand 4X4 car, 3 motorbikes, 6 desktops, 6 laptops, 2 scanners, 2 photocopiers, 2 projectors, 2 screens, a *voip system*⁶ and a *camera control system*. Due to previous direct contributions (in particular AID 9156 that has contributed about 70.000 euro for laboratory equipment, reactors and other material and *Top up Allowance* (TuA) for students and centre employees) PHL is a forefront structure perfectly equipped to develop activities superior to the ordinary ones. Among the activities promoted by the PHL is the quality control of research and tests carried out in other laboratories, the realization of tests more sophisticated than those generally realized in other laboratories, in particular monthly screening for malaria and water quality tests, thanks to a series of agreements that have been in existence since 2005 among PHL and the Ministry of Water, and with the World Health Organisation (WHO) for the schistosomatic monitoring and gastric parasite infections.

The ultimate aim of the skills enhancement courses offered by the project, through a mix of professional updates and the provision of tools and equipment, is to promote the staff involved or at least a large part of it from simple data collectors to health information officers. The training courses- among which one of the same typology was realized during our mission in May 2012- aim at sharing the ultimate purposes of the information system with health operators from different Districts, making efforts to raise awareness of the possible benefits of accurate and systematic data collection and their transfer to the elaboration and analysis centres. Careful management of data could encourage the planning of services, stocks, available human resources and the District's logistic organization at a territorial level.

In May 2011, an evaluation and planning mission of the project directly managed by AID 9156 and lead by Elio Omobono noticed - a year before the actual mission - that “*the*

⁶ VoIP or "Voice on IP" is the technology allowing to transmit full-duplex audio in real time on a data network with IP protocol.

PHL, although the high number of staff (...) and adequate laboratories structures at its disposal, is highly underused in its role of national laboratory for tuberculosis (TB) and Malaria. The number of samples submitted by peripheral centres tested in 2010 has been very low". The current mission did not notice an increase in the centre's operations. No more than 10 samples for malaria are analysed per day; 15 culture samples are analysed for TB per month. After all, as the director states, the centre operates on the basis of projects and funds added to those provided by the MoHSW for its ordinary management and according to him, these are not enough for the full functioning of the centre.

The PHL and de Carneri Foundation institutional counterpart, the HMIS, proved to be, despite some initial resistance, an efficient and motivated ally that has been able to respond to the challenge launched by the project. Within the department the project found highly skilled and devoted staff that could actively attend project activities and encourage the territorial services to embrace its purposes and objectives and discuss its evolution. It makes a great effort to sensitize other departments and the Ministry's executives to the issues and goals achieved by the project.

Impact and Sustainability

Rating Impact: "B"

The project's results succeeded in contributing to the strengthening of the HMIS institutional abilities improving its reputation and status within the Zanzibar Health Ministry. In fact it is considered a crucial and forefront department in the next health planning. Because of its data production the HMIS is not only called upon to fulfil a series of information and acknowledgement needs on the demand and health response in Zanzibar, but also to provide the Ministry with a very important tool for the valorisation of its activity and, through the various periodic reports published, an institutional communication tool that enables dialogue with the International community, experts and donors.

A very crucial aspect that has long-term consequences and impacts on the project is the relatively fragile situation caused by the human resources management in the PHL, the HMIS and in the public health sector in general. Over 50% of the costs borne by the MoHSW in Zanzibar are supported by international donors. The wages of the public employees in Zanzibar are far lower than those on the mainland and the TuA system has become structural in the system. Thus, the absence of special projects that justify allowances that compensate for lower wages, forces the system to operate at the minimum necessary pace. Unfortunately, the higher the level of competence required for services and tasks, the more this negative effect is seen. This inaccuracy of the system, based on demand, projects and on individual initiatives rather than on coordinated multi-year planning determines a series of distortions that makes the health public system converge with some market-like mechanisms:

- a high turnover of staff, in particular of the most motivated and qualified;
- internal competition among services and offices in order to obtain the best resources when a funded initiative is launched;
- impossibility to grant long-term positions as they are always linked to the faith of the projects funded by funds other than those provided by the Ministry.

The project has focused mainly on the medium level staff and services, i.e. reaching primarily the Districts' operators, those of the local hospitals, of the central HMIS office, some of the PHCU operators and others from various health facilities. This approach concentrated during the activities year has not been considered sufficient and has not resulted in effective empowerment. Much remains to be done, as planned in the three-year project currently on going (SISME II). Beyond the effects that must be produced at this intermediate level, empowering and sensitization work has to be done on the other two levels; on the basic health services staff, even in its territorial ramifications and in the less professionalized services domains, and in the MoHSW executives from which should come the imprint to make sure that correct data management becomes an integrated tool of the economic, functional, logistic and strategic planning of health services in the two islands of Unguja and Pemba.

Although there is still plenty to do, during the mission it was possible to appreciate how the participants of the courses already use the data from their district to prepare their annual plans. Because of the availability of accurate data, they are able to justify certain requirements or choices in the territorial services they are responsible for.

Rating Sustainability: "C"

The services and benefits produced by the project's sustainability are at risk of drastic reduction if international community support slows down. This high dependence on external funding is not an isolated condition affecting the PHL, and it is very common in the context in which the MoHSW and the Zanzibar government generally operate. In fact, the public system is heavily dependent on the budgetary support and various donors' agreements with the central government and ministries directly operating in Zanzibar. External donation has not succeeded in consolidating a system able to operate without ad hoc funding.

The uncertain PHL financial sustainability must be seen in the context of a system highly dependent on external aid and that specifically in the Zanzibar case, the direct repercussion on the availability and recruitment of human resources is evident.

On the contrary, the project has had great results on the PHL institutional sustainability front, through the collocation of the HMIS Operative Unit at its premises, with the consequent centralization of a series of networking functions that ultimately make the PHL an important articulation of the Zanzibar health public system. The fact that as a result of the project and other funding the PHL has become a centre of excellence at a national level further increases its attraction and potential in the system.

This institutional sustainability could be strengthened if the PHL would dedicate more space to services to the territory and population with immediate effect. As it has already been said in previous assessments (May 2011, Omobono's report) "the technical and human resources of the PHL could be employed more efficiently and with an excellent benefit/costs ratio if the structure would be made accessible to local population as clinic diagnostic laboratory".

Summary Tab

The summary tab of evaluative judgments of the executive summary is repeated here for ease reference

Planning	Relevance Rating: “B” satisfactory	
<p>The project is relevant with the commitment of the Italian Cooperation in Tanzania and Zanzibar where the DGCD has launched during the same period other initiatives in the health sector and only partially consistent with the Zanzibar health policies. The potential positive effects of efficient data use and information systems are remarkable, both on the prevention front and in that of more efficient planning and management of services and investments. This urgency, as long as it is consistent and self-evident, is only indirectly addressed to the immediate satisfaction of the final beneficiaries’ basic needs, the Zanzibar families. More direct and explicit use of the Public Health Laboratory (PHL) in the territorial health services would have strengthened the intervention relevance regarding the local needs as they are perceived by the population.</p>		
Design Quality Rating: “B” satisfactory		
<p>The results represent three consistent steps towards the achievement of the project’s specific objective in addition to the punctual identification of direct beneficiaries, about 500 health operators active in the dispensaries, districts and hospitals. The project logic is fully understandable with reference to the process the Ivo de Carneri Foundation launched in 1997. Initially launched as a three-year project, but in actual fact limited to one year, its aims and ambitions have not reduced proportionally. Initially launched on a three-year basis but then limited to one year without reducing its ambitions, the project results to be undersized compared to the timing, which has been extended for seven additional months followed by the definition of a further three-year phase.</p>		
Specific Objective	Impact Rating: “B” satisfactory Sustainability Rating: “C” problems	Overall objective
<p>Strengthening of the PHL central role and of the Health Districts structures through the adequate provision of means and equipment for the health data collection and human resources training in the epidemic surveillance area.</p>	<p>The project contributed to institutional empowerment, providing its support to the “Health Management Information System” qualification and its status to the Health Ministry in Zanzibar. The project focused mainly on the staff and services at the intermediate level, i.e. reaching mainly the District, hospital, areas and HMIS central office operators and some in the health facilities. There is still plenty of work to do, as planned by the on-going three-year project (SISME II Phase) plans. The services and benefits produced by the project are at risk of drastic reductions if international community support slows down; this high external dependence is very common in the context in which the MoHSW and the Zanzibar government operates in general. On the contrary, the project has brought significant results on the PHL institutional sustainability, including the HMIS Operative Unit at its premises, with the consequent centralization of a series of networking functions that have made the PHL an important articulation of the Zanzibar health public system. This institutional sustainability could be strengthened if the PHL would dedicate more space to services to the territory and population with immediate effect</p>	<p>Enhancement of the population’s health conditions in Zanzibar by the rehabilitation of the epidemic and endemic diseases surveillance system , as an indispensable tool for the health interventions’ improvement</p>

Results	Effectiveness Rating: “B” satisfactory	Specific Objective
4) strengthening of Pemba’s Ministerial	The main result achieved by the project consisted in the strengthening of the Ministerial Office in Pemba	Strengthening of the PHL-IdC central role and of the Health

<p>Office through the HMIS (Health Management Information System) Operative Unit collocation in the Public Health Laboratory Ivo De Carneri (PHL-IdC);</p> <p>5) the human resources training in epidemic surveillance;</p> <p>6) The Health District structures strengthening by the provision of equipment and means for health data collection and analysis</p>	<p>through the Health Management Information System Operative Unit placement in the Public Health Laboratory Ivo De Carneri (PHL-IdC). The PHL represents a forefront and well-equipped structure able to carry out activities at a higher level than those it usually manages. To date, despite the high number of staff members and adequate laboratory structures at its disposal, the PHGL is underutilised in its role as national laboratory. Funds provided by the MoHSW for the ordinary management of the centre are insufficient to ensure its operation at the optimal level and the centre therefore operates below full potential. The PHL remains active with special project and external funds. Data produced by the HMIS is used by the MoHSW for the publication of periodical reports. Thanks to the project, the HMIS vaunts an excellent reputation within the Ministry and donors involved in the health sector. The PHL and Carneri Foundation institutional counterpart, the HMIS department, proved to be, despite some initial resistance, an efficient and motivated ally that has successfully embraced the challenge presented by the project.</p>	<p>Districts structures by the equipment and means for the collection and analysis of health data supply and human resources training in the epidemic surveillance domain.</p>
<p>Activities</p>	<p>Efficiency Rating: “B” satisfactory</p>	<p>Results</p>
<p>1) space identification, equipment purchase and installation, data transfer and local staff training.</p> <p>2) courses organization, didactic material production.</p> <p>3) district and central headquarters equipment, means and vehicles</p>	<p>Most of the project activities have been realized in scheduled time. The supply of equipment to PHL and to the Health Districts faced no particular problems or obstacles and PHL staff proved to be motivated and efficient. The wages public policy that tends to motivate the participation through forms of economic incentive required special care in the human resources management as well as in the beneficiaries’ participation. The PHL employs, about 50 permanent staff members of which about 90% is paid by the MoHSW and up to another 300 people are paid from the project funds, on a needs basis. The training has noticed a level of attendance higher than expected, involving about 526 different typologies of health operators. From the qualitative results perspective, the training outputs have been lower than desired due to the starting-level of skills of the operators, generally poor because of the limited presence of epidemiology statistic characteristics in the conventional CVs of the country. In order to enhance the training efficiency the Ivo de Carneri Foundation realized further training courses compared to those initially planned.</p>	<p>4) strengthening of Pemba’s Ministerial Office through the HMIS (Health Management Information System) Operative Unit collocation in the Public Health Laboratory Ivo De Carneri (PHL-IdC);</p> <p>5) the human resources training in epidemic surveillance;</p> <p>6) The Health District structures strengthening by the provision of equipment and means for health data collection and analysis.</p>

Lessons learned and recommendations

The SISME project proves to be relevant to MoHSW policy in Zanzibar both in terms of orientation and priority sectors expressed by the Italian Cooperation in Tanzania in recent years. The issue linked to the strengthening of the health information system is certainly a key-point for a functional and dramatic improvement of the planning and then of the services provision in the two islands in Zanzibar, even if this need has not been perceived equally urgent by the local population, the true final beneficiary.

Recommendation 1- In order to make permanent the transversal introduction of the importance of an efficient information system to the health staff, it would be worth entering part of the basic epidemiology, informatics and management acknowledgements of the health information system in the Medicine School CVs, where the health operators are trained. In this way the medical and paramedical staff could be widely sensitized on the importance of creating an efficient health information centre in order to increase the synergies, the spread and general efficiency in the collection and use of data.

Recommendation 2 - It would be desirable that the laboratory intensifies its services to the territory integrating its research and quality diagnostic activities, putting at the community's disposal its own clinical analysis services, improving the overall service quality and efficiency, creating a benefit for the users and reducing the workload of the other centres, primarily the Chake Chake hospital.

CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND CROSS-CUTTING ASPECTS OF THE THREE PROJECTS

As already mentioned in the Executive Summary, some of the criticisms are linked to the time gap between the planning phase and the implementation phase of the intervention. The variations in time of some of the project parameters made it necessary to revise the objectives, procedures and methods of intervention, with consequent impact on expected results. Against the concerns raised, the following recommendation are made:

Recommendation 1 - Make more efficient, prompt and effective the investigation process for the approval of the promoted projects. In order to reduce the time spent on investigation, it would be desirable to approve projects on the basis of a parameters series, synthetic and systematized bringing projects up to date and therefore avoiding the need - during the assignment phase - for definition of a detailed operative plan.

Recommendation 2 - Provide a micro-intervention program that ensures, with low investment, the sustainability and consolidation of the positive processes already in place, maximising and making the benefits already produced by the projects abiding. A residual percentage of the financial resources accorded to plans, could be directed to this consolidation phase.

Recommendation 3 - Ensure coordination and exchange through the UTL antenna in Dar es Salaam

It is of vital importance to ease the experiences exchange and crosscutting problems solving, as well as the in-depth examination of issues made by some NGO's to the benefit of others or use the territorial presidium guaranteed in various Tanzanian regions by different organisations. If it is difficult to propose the quantitative strengthening of the central and peripheral technical structures in times of dramatic public expenditure cuts, it is highly desirable and possible to enhance their efficiency and effectiveness, by streamlining the procedures, making the responsibilities assignment clear, establishing simple regular and timely reporting systems.

The following recommendation are addressed to NGOs:

Recommendation 4 - Pay more attention to the IOVs project indicators definition, to the baseline data collection and to the internal monitoring system that must refer to the Logical Framework (LF) as main tool. It is important to remember that this tool should not be reduced to the *Logical Framework Matrix* but is composed of seven phases, all necessary and consistent with each other; one of the fundamental aspects of project preparation using the *Logical Framework Approach (LFA)* is its participative process. A LF conceived with the participation of the main actors ensures far greater success than one offered by a LF built by an external project manager alone. If it is not possible to do that during the formulation phase, it should at least be done during the reprogramming phase, when the actors are together in the same place and have full awareness of the context in which they must operate.

Recommendation 5 - Evaluation of the created infrastructures potentialities.

The objectives, expected results and desired expectations for the centres and physical structures built by the NGOs functionally to the programs must be carefully evaluated: in all three cases (the CRAS, MTU and the LUP) the potentialities inherent to the projects are not adequately exploited and management perspective not fully realized.

Recommendation 6 - Risk analysis: Risk analysis, the elaboration of a risk management strategy, an exit strategy and a convincing sustainability plan for the activities and benefits linked to the project should be included in the ordinary project management practice.

ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT 1 - Acronyms list

CAHW	Community Animal Health Workers
EC	European Commission
CEFA	European Committee for Training and Agriculture
COPE	Cooperazione Paesi Emergenti
CRAS	Consorzio Rurale Agro-ecologico di Songea
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
DANIDA	Danish Development Assistance
DGCS	Direzione Generale Cooperazione allo Sviluppo
FOCSIV	Federazione Organismi Cristiani Servizio Internazionale Volontario
HISP	Health Information System Program
HMIS	Health Management Information System
FIdC	Fondazione Ivo De Carneri
IdC	Ivo De Carneri (Foundation)
IOV	Objectively Verifiable Indicators
LFA	Logical Framework Approach
LUP	Land Use Plan
MoHWS	Ministry of Health and Social Welfare (of Zanzibar)
MTU	Mkuru Training Centre
OCSE	Organizzazione per la Cooperazione e lo Sviluppo Economico
PCM	Project Cycle Management
PHCU	Public Health Centre Unit
PHL	Public Health Laboratory
LF	Logical Framework
SAAFI	Sustainable Agriculture Against Food Insecurity
SISME	Sistema di Sorveglianza per Malattie Endemiche
SMART	Specific, Measurable, Available, Reliable, Timely
TB	Tubercle Bacillus, Tuberculosis
TuA	Top up Allowance
VETA	Vocational Education Training Authority
VGS	Village Game Scout
WHO	World Health Organisation
ZAMREC	Zanzibar Medical Research Ethical Committee

ATTACHMENT 2 - Tanzania's Mission Agenda - May 2012

	Morning	Evening
06-may-12	Flight Catania - Rome	Flight Rome - Dar es Salaam
07-may-12	Mission's logistic preparation	Desk work
08-may-12	Mission's logistic preparation	Meeting with UTL Antenna in Dar es Salaam
09-may-12	Flight Dar es Salaam - Pemba, training session participation	Meeting with the PHL executive staff and MoHSW staff
10-may-12	Field-visit and tour of the PHL and its facilities – Visit of PHCU in Konde	Visit of the Cottage Hospital in Vittongocji
11-may-12	Debriefing with PHL staff - Flight Pemba - Unguja	Desk work and interview to HMIS project coordinator
12-may-12	Visit of the HMIS HQs and meeting with its executive and staff – Meeting with DGCS project officer	Meeting with the MoHSW undersecretary - Debriefing with HMIS project coordinator
13-may-12	Flight Unguja - Arusha, briefing with Oikos Executive	Meeting Oikos and Oikos East Africa team
14-may-12	Meeting with Meru District's staff-Crossing of the Arusha National Park	Visit of the area, meeting with local authorities, visit of the Uwiro Village and Mkuru Training Camp
15-may-12	Meeting with Oikos staff, Village Game Scout and Community Animal Health Workers	
16-may-12	Visit of the Mkuru Camel Safari and Maasai Women Art	Return in Arusha – Visita of Masai Women Art shop in Arisha and debriefing with Oikos staff
17-may-12	Flight Kilimanjaro - Dar es Salaam and Dar es Salaam Songea	First visit of the CRAS centre and first meeting with COPE staff, meeting with Archdiocese representantion
18-may-12	In-depth visit of the CRAS, interviews and on-site visit of its activities	Meeting with trainers, local authorities and Archdiocese
19-may-12	Meeting with 20 students	Visit to two micro entrepreneurs former students and microcredit beneficiaries
20-may-12	Meeting with the Province Executive and ex Major of Msindo	Visit to two micro entrepreneurs former students and microcredit beneficiaries
21-may-12	Meeting with CRAS administration	Debriefing and departure for Dar es Salaam, meeting with the Country representative and COPE's executive
22-may-12	Debriefing with the Ambassador	Debriefing with UTL coordinator in Dar es Salaam
23-may-12	Flight Dar es Saalam - Rome	Flight Rome – Catania

ATTACHMENT 3 List of people met

Name	Surname	Role	Project/NGO
Hemed	Ali Mohid	Community Health Nurse and Director, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Ayubu	Ally	Farmer, 20 years beneficiary	COPE
Lilia	Aminieli	CAHW Olkumguado	Oikos
Lucas	Atanas	CRAS Agricultural Engineer	COPE
Laura	Bassini	Oikos Italia Country representative	Oikos
Peter	Bauala	CRAS trainer livestock, agroforest nursery tree	COPE
Marco	Bertoldi	Volunteer, administrative assistant CRAS centre	COPE
Proches	Burette	Livestock field officer, Meru District	Oikos
Valentina	Carnimeo	Laboratory activities Consultant	F. De Carneri
Peter	Carpentere	UVIKASO	COPE
Alfred	Chacula	Farmer, 26 years, beneficiary	COPE
Aibou	Chafari Gnema	Msingo Chairman	COPE
Shairu	Chuma	Responsible for data processing - Meru District	Oikos
Omar	Dadi Nahoda	Head of HMIS unit - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Nancy	D'Arrigo	COPE Country coordinator	COPE
Johan	Elias	VGS Mkuru	Oikos
Aminiel	G. Yona	Village Executive Officer - Uwiro Village	Oikos
Sandra	Gasbarri	COPE Volunteer, nursery responsible	COPE
Angela	Giacomazzi	Head of the project "Diagnosis and health system empowerment..." of CI Direct management	F. De Carneri
Gingo	Gingo	CRAS trainer gardening and rice-cultivation	COPE
Michele	Giongrandi	COPE Executive	COPE
Faki	H Yussuf	Zonal Medical Officer (2mo)	F. De Carneri
Fatma	Hamad Ibrahim	Health orderly, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Miza	Hamad Jabiri	Public nurse B, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Tine	Heji Mahid	Health orderly, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Benant	Impongi	CRAS student from Songea, 20 years	COPE
Placido	Ingaia	Ngungutema, farmer, 29 years, beneficiary	COPE
Faki	Ismail Bakar	District Surveillance Officer, Micheweni District - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Desideria	Jocoba	CRAS trainer rabbit keeping, agroforestry, life skills	COPE
Alfons	Jovu	CRAS student from Mptimbi	COPE
Mohamed	K. Birika	Ex Chair of Msindo and actual Provincial Executive	COPE
Trasias	Kagenzi	DED Director, Meru District	Oikos
Adgenda	Kakussa	Mbea, breeder, 25 years beneficiary	COPE
Levina	Kasimba	CRAS student, from Songea, 19 years	COPE
Salma	Kassim Mussa	Environmental health officer, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Janet	Kaunoila	CRAS student, 19 years	COPE
Ahmed	Kharim Ali	Laboratory Technician, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Prisca	Komba	Breeder, 21 years, beneficiary	COPE

Maigrina	Kumba	CRAS trainer mais crops, marketing integrated pest management, crop production	COPE
Eva	Kundy	Statistician, Meru District	Oikos
Ramadhani	Kupaza	Director Oikos East Africa	Oikos
George	Liser	VGS Uwiro	Oikos
Joseph	Lucas	VGS Uwiro	Oikos
Luxford	Lugongo	CRAS coordinator for the 'Archdiocese	COPE
Shaali	M Ame	Head of Lab services, Resident Representative Fondazione Ivo de Carneri	F. De Carneri
Yahya	M.S. Al-Sawafy	District Administrative Secretariat - Meru District	F. De Carneri
Pita	Mabuga	Health orderly, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	Oikos
Saaimu	Mahid Mwaiab	Public nurse B, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Halima	Massoud Kombo	Staff Nurse coordinator, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Nasra	Mbarouk Omar	CDO Community development, Meru District	F. De Carneri
Grace	Mghase	Land and natural resources officer, Meru District	Oikos
Amma	Mhamba	CRAS trainer integrated farming, poltry	Oikos
Agnes	Migunda	CRAS trainer dairy goats, fish farms, pigs, bees and soil conservation	COPE
Vitus	Mijnga	Principal Secretary, Cottage Hospital Vittongocji - Pemba	COPE
Katieu	Mkuu	CRAS student from Nantumbo, near Ntomba, 25 years	F. De Carneri
Amani	Mossa	CRAS warehouseman	COPE
Edgar	Mumba	CRAS Chief accountant	COPE
Zakayo	Mwampagatwa	Public nurse B, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	COPE
Saada	Nassor Khomi	CAHW Uwiro	F. De Carneri
Lucas	Ndetaulo	VGS Losimon	Oikos
Nalusho	Ndoki	Msindo Executive Officer	Oikos
Safari	Ngigo Tendagi	CRAS student from Songea, 30 years	COPE
Osui	Ngomera	CRAS student from Songea, 22 years	COPE
Joseph	Ngoniai	CRAS microcredit manager	COPE
Friedrik	Ngoniani	CRAS trainer traditional medicine, soil science	COPE
Franco	Ngoniari	CRAS student, from Dar es Salaam	COPE
Alfred	Nguelue	CRAS student from Songea, 20 years	COPE
Dennis	Njurue	CAHW Uwiro	Oikos
Aimbora	Nkirua	VGS Olkumguado	Oikos
Jakson	Noenko	Local Project coordinator Oikos East Africa	Oikos
Janemary	Ntalwila	Tanzania Maasai Women Art Manager	Oikos
Marina	Oliver (Tati)	Environmental health officer, PHCU of Konde - Pemba	Oikos
Hassan	Omar Hassan	Italian Cooperation Health Consultant	F. De Carneri
Elio	Omobono	CRAS student from Namtungo, 20 years	F. De Carneri
Kurna	Ongo	Assistant head of HMIS - Pemba	COPE
Msanif	Othman Masoua	Project Manager	F. De Carneri
Giovanna	Paltrinieri	CRAS centre Technical assistance, veterinary and coordination	F. De Carneri
Riccardo	Panichi	Environmental consultant	COPE
Francesco	Parisi	CRAS student from Namtungo, 20 years	F. De Carneri
Olwand	Pili	Focal point antenna UTL in Tanzania	COPE
Monica	Pisu		Tutti i progetti

Giada	Raimondo	Desk officer Fondazione Ivo De Carneri, Mlano	F. De Carneri
Rossella	Rossi	Oikos Institute President	Oikos
Suleiman	Said Omar	Information Officer - Pemba	F. De Carneri
Mohamed	Saleh Jiddawi	Principal Secretary, MOHSW Zanzibar	F. De Carneri
Fronaili	Sarikeli	VGS Kisimiri Chini	Oikos
Isaia	Shakuet	Sub Village Chief Uwiro, Maasai leader	Oikos
Hamisi	Singano	Planning Officer, Meru District	Oikos
Dauson	Uvio	Chairman Uwiro Village	Oikos
Pierluigi	Velardi	Italian Ambassador in Tanzania	Tutti i progetti
Seliman	Zimann	Head of HMIS unit - MOH Zanzibar	F. De Carneri

Attachment 4 - List of the main documents consulted

	Project
SISME – Project document outline	De Carneri
Appreciation Letter of MoHSW local authorities	De Carneri
Agreement MoHSW - Fondazione Ivo De Carneri	De Carneri
SISME - Audit report of the financial statements	De Carneri
SISME - List of expenses incurred	De Carneri
SISME – Declaration and synthetic table of expenses incurred	De Carneri
SISME – Accounting Framework	De Carneri
SISME – Final report	De Carneri
SISME – Annual report	De Carneri
SISME – Six-monthly report	De Carneri
SISME – Project results Ppt Presentation	De Carneri
The Mount Meru Challenge, integrating conservation and development in Northern Tanzania	Oikos
Aid 8152 Project document	Oikos
Brief description of MAE LUP activities in Ngarenanyuki ward Arumeru District	Oikos
Not onerous variation proposal	Oikos
Cooperation agreement Oikos - Meru district	Oikos
Oikos Mission reports 2009 e 2010	Oikos
Aid 8152 Intervention Logical Schema	Oikos
Aid 8152 Final report and III annual financial statement	Oikos
Aid 8178 Project Document	COPE
Aid 8178 Report on implemented activities (July 2007-April 2008)	COPE
Aid 8178 Report on implemented activities (December 2009-April 2010)	COPE
Aid 8178 Progress report (July 2007 - October 2008)	COPE
Aid 8178 approval of the variation demanded (October 2009)	COPE
Aid 8178 Residual report Rapporto I year (October 2008-april 2009)	COPE
Aid 8178 Progress report Relazione II year (July 2008 – December 2009)	COPE
Aid 8178 Progress report Relazione III year (December 2009 – march 2010)	COPE
Aid 8178 Synthetic Evaluation of intervention results related to the specific objectives	COPE
Aid 8178 Closing form	COPE
Aid 8178 Photographic Report	COPE